```
1
             CITY OF SOUTHFIELD PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
 2
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7
               DATE TAKEN: DECEMBER 13, 2023
 8
               TIME: 6:30 p.m. - 8:26 p.m.
 9
                    (Based on Time Zone from Notice)
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
    TRANSCRIBED BY: SHEILA H. RAYMOND
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	APPEARANCES
2	
3	COUNCIL MEMBERS:
4	GERALYN STEPHENS-GUNN, Chair
5	JEREMY GRIFFIS, Vice Chair
6	ANTHONY MARTIN, Commissioner
7	GHANA ADELL GOODWIN-DYE, Commissioner
8	ROBERT WILLIS, Secretary
9	TERRY CROAD, Director of Planning
10	THOMAS PAISON, Deputy City Planner
11	THOMAS FAISON, Deputy City Flaimer
12	APPEARED VIA IN PERSON
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	
3	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Good evening. I'd like to
4	welcome everyone to the city of Southfield regular meeting of
5	the planning commission.
6	At this time I'd like for us to stand and do the
7	Pledge of Allegiance.
8	(Pledge of Allegiance recited by all)
9	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you. May I have a roll
10	call, please?
11	UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Yes, ma'am.
12	Ms. Goodwin-Dye?
13	MS. GOODWIN-DYE: Here.
14	UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Mr. Griffis?
15	MR. GRIFFIS: Here.
16	UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Mr. Martin?
17	MR. MARTIN: Here.
18	UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Mr. Willis?
19	MR. WILLIS: Here.
20	UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Dr. Stephens-Gunn?
21	DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Here.
22	UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Madam Chair, you have two
23	absences, but you do have a quorum to conduct business today.
24	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you very much.
25	I'm sure everyone has had an opportunity to review our

```
1
    agenda for this evening. Is there a motion to approve our
 2
    agenda for this evening?
 3
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: To the Chair, motion to approve
    the planning commission December 13th agenda.
 5
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                    Support.
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner
   Martin and second by Commissioner Willis that we approve today's
    agenda. All in favor?
 8
 9
              (All in favor)
10
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                   Oppose? Motion carries.
11
              Gentleman, are there any announcements and
12
    communications for this evening?
13
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                    No, ma'am.
14
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                    No, ma'am.
15
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: All right. Moving right along.
16
    We're going to take a look at item D for the property located at
17
    24848 Southfield Road, PSLU23-0017, special use hearing,
18
    PSP23-0017 site plan review.
              May I have some background, please?
19
20
                               Thank you, ma'am. The this is a gas
              THE DEPARTMENT:
21
    station, existing gas station, on the corner of Southfield and
22
    10 mile.
             This would be the southeast corner. They are looking
23
    to add liquor sales to the existing gas station. No additions.
2.4
    We'll get into a little more detail here. Just for reference,
    because this came for discussion at our prior meeting, just a
25
```

```
diagram showing the blue is the location of the subject site.
 1
    The red diamond to the north of that is the nearby liquor store,
    New Abbey Wine and Liquor. And the oval orange to the south is
    the nearest other gas station. That larger black circle is just
    a 1,000 foot radius around the site. So those are all the --
    it's the gas stations agents and liquor stores within that 1,000
    foot radius, just for reference as to what's in that immediate
    area, because there was some discussion of that. We just
 8
 9
    thought we would put it right out there in a slide.
10
    aerial, as you can see, the gas station has a canopy that's
11
    attached to a building. It goes out toward 10 Mile and its curb
    cuts on 10 Mile and Southfield. Existing conditions on the
12
13
    site, we took a photo of the property here on a sunny day when
14
    it was functioning. Here is the pumps. Current zoning is a P.
15
    There's like a 30 foot vehicular parking zoning along
16
    Southfield, and then the remainder of the site where the gas
17
    station is and the structures are is in the B-3 general
18
    business.
               The future land use map for this is commercial
19
    office, that's consistent with the zoning and with the use.
                                                                 We
    do have a existing site plan. They are looking to do a few --
20
21
    while the building itself is not expanding and the exterior is
    not changing, they're doing a couple of site improvements.
22
23
    They're going to attach the walkway along the front of the
24
    building out to the sidewalk. Right now there's no sidewalk
    attachment there. So there's going to be an extension of the
25
```

```
sidewalk out to the Southfield sidewalk, and they're adding bike
 1
    racks, and there's going to be a freshening up of the
                       This is the actual landscape plan that
 3
    landscaping also.
    they're going to refresh the landscaping. Not that the
    landscaping was in terrible condition when I visited the site,
    but it almost -- you can almost always use freshen up on the
    landscaping for almost any commercial property. Floor plan,
    they did touch this up since the last meeting.
 8
                                                    If you look at
    the labeling, they now have -- show the shelves behind the
10
    cashier, it says liquor shelves. And then they've got the beer
    cave and the five coolers with doors labeled for beer, and then
11
    four of the racks in the middle labeled for wine to give a
12
    reference as to where the alcohol sales would be located in the
13
14
             So it's within the existing layout.
                                                   They're just
15
    placing certain products with new product. Elevations, these
16
    are the existing elevations of the building. And some interior
17
    photos they were kind enough to provide us.
                                                 The top left there
    is the beer coolers, those five coolers in a row.
18
                                                       The middle
19
    one is that, it's what's going to be the beer cave where you can
             And then the top right is a wine rack on the right
    walk in.
20
21
    side. Below it is the wine rack from the left side. And then
22
    the other two on the bottom left are showing you product back
23
    there, but those are the shelves where the liquor would go
2.4
    behind the counter where the teller's at. We do have the
    Petitioner present if they'd like to come forward to answer
25
```

```
1
    questions.
              MR. MARKIE ALDO: Good evening. Markie Aldo, 24848
 2
    Southfield, Southfield, Michigan.
 3
              MR. ROCKY ALDO: Rocky Aldo, 2848 (sic) Southfield
 4
   Road, Southfield, Michigan.
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Can you give us a little bit of
   background of what it is you're doing and why you're interested
    in doing it?
 8
 9
              MR. MARKIE ALDO: Well, since, you know, the ordinance
    changed, you know, to allow, you know, this gas station, you
10
11
    know, beer and wine and liquors, you know, we just -- that's
12
    when we apply, you know, to get, you know, to improve the
13
    business and to get -- we've been there about 14 years. We've
14
    been paying all the taxes, all the cleaning, everything,
15
    whatever required, which is, roughly the tax is about $22,000 a
16
    year. And we've been maintaining, you know, the property to the
    standard to whatever City they require. And we just like to get
17
18
    that, you know, the liquor, beer and wine because the ordinance
19
    and we ought to meet them the ordinance required.
20
              MR. ROCKY ALDO: Trying to improve to the business and
21
    serve the community.
22
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Thank you.
23
              MR. MARKIE ALDO:
                                Okay.
2.4
                               This is subject to a public hearing.
              THE DEPARTMENT:
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: At this time I'd like to open
25
```

the public hearing for PSLU23-0017.

Gentleman, you can be seated.

If there's any public here that would like to share their thoughts or comments regarding PSLU23-0017 please approach the podium. You will have exactly three minutes to share your thoughts.

Please state your name and your address.

MR. SAMONA: My name is Randy Samona. I'm counsel for New Abbey Wine and Liquor, address is 25030 Southfield Road.

I'm here today -- tonight before this honorable commission to express our strong opposition to the special use request on behalf of 10 Southfield Incorporated to permit the addition of liquor sales to the existing gas station located at 10 Mile and Southfield.

As it currently stands, New Abbey offers a full selection of beer, wine and liquor for off consumption premises. There's also a CVS Pharmacy located .1 miles away from this location, right across the street. They also offer a full selection of beer, wine and liquor for off consumption premises -- I'm sorry -- off premises consumption.

Ahead of tonight's meeting, I did send to the honorable commission 24 different maps of every liquor retail store in Southfield and how close the nearest liquor store is to that liquor store, and out of the 24 maps that I presented, there's only two locales that have liquor stores that close to

one another with new Abbey and CVS being one of them. There is not an intersection in Southfield that has three liquor stores at that intersection. So from -- you know, this undue proposal for a special use would be the first of its kind, and I don't think that it's necessary nor conducive to the city of Southfield.

When you ask the petitioner here, what's the reasoning? They're saying we'd like to get a liquor license because the ordinance changed. They're not talking about anything with regards to the city, the residents, the people, safety, health, welfare, traffic, anything like that. I did submit publications to this Board in advance as well with regards to alcohol outlet density and the fact that an increase in alcohol outlets in such a saturated area leads to violent crimes, auto accidents, increase rates of alcohol consumption, underaged drinking. It's just not good for the city, not good for the residents overall.

Additionally, when you look at the city ordinances within the City of Southfield, section 7.195 of the items to be considered when granting such an SDD license, one of the criteria states that the location proposed and methods of operation must not detrimentally or unreasonably impact nearby property owners, businesses and residents. This proposed addition to this gas station, I think, does just that. You know, it's going to really add a lot of traffic to that area.

```
It's not that big of a gas station to add $250,000 of required
 1
    inventory in liquor it. And, again, it just --
 2
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: You thirty seconds.
 3
              MR. SAMONA: Thank you. The jam that it's going to
    cause in that area is just not going to be conducive to traffic,
    and, again, it's just not very good for the health and welfare
    of the citizens of Southfield, and, again, I do ask humbly that
    this honorable commission -- I know there's an SDD ordinance
 8
    that changed, but it doesn't mean that this commission should
 9
    place the liquor stores so close to each other so as to have a
10
11
    liquor boulevard of some sort. So I trust, again, that you will
    make the right decision to consider these facts before making
12
13
    your decision today. Thank you.
14
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your
15
    thoughts.
16
              Is there anyone else that is interested in sharing
17
    their thoughts regarding PSLU23-0017 special use?
18
              Please share your name and your address.
19
              MR. ATICIA: Andy Aticia. I'm the owner of the plaza
    across the street from 25000 up to 25100.
20
21
              My tenants, they're against it. I have 11 tenants.
22
    And we have a liquor in store already, and there is a liquor
23
    store, CVS. There is liquor. Now if you get more liquor
2.4
    license it's going to be more trouble, more traffic, and I'm
    against it. And gas and liquor and beer and wine does not
25
```

```
1 match, that will increase drink and driving. So that's why I'm
2 against it. Thank you.
```

CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your thoughts.

3

5

Please share your name and your address.

6 MR. KERNEY: My name is Leo Kerney. I'm at 22400 Lathrup Boulevard. And what I got to say is this right here, look at the volume, look at the streets, look at the consumption 8 9 of what this store has. This store sells gas, and the gas that they sell, people cannot get in and out. And it's not a variety 10 11 of a place that you can have people come in and park and go get 12 liquor from this store. It's not a big parking lot. It's 13 anything. Only thing this is going to cause is a lot of 14 congestion, probably on safety. When people trying to pull out 15 into traffic, people might get hit and everything else because 16 it does not have a parking lot to consume what people buying 17 liquor going to stop and get. Now, my thing of it is, okay, 18 it's on the corner. Yes. Now, you got people going out on the 19 opposite end. You got people coming out on this end. So what you going to do when you got a traffic jam? What you going to 20 21 do when people start moving and whatever else? That's going to cause more traffic violations, people getting hurt and 22 23 everything else. Now it's not about, how could I say, people 24 want to rob liquor stores or whatever else. It's not about that. It's about the safety of the community. Now, if the 25

1 community is not safe, this place do not have the proper volume to handle the cars that's going to be stopping in and getting 2 liquor. You can look at the stores right now. You got one, two, three, four, five, six, probably seven, eight spots where you can park, then you got the other spots where you getting So how can you do that? Because, see, now everybody going to this gas station to try to get liquor, it's going to be volume. Sometimes volume is good. Sometimes volume is bad. 8 But right now volume is very bad for this store because it 9 doesn't have an appropriate parking lot to have the right amount 10 11 of anything for to get in and out. Okay. Thank you. 12 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your 13 thoughts. Please share your name and your address. 14 15 MR. BROWN: My name is Jeffrey Brown. I live at 25124 16 Sherwood Circle. 17 I'm about 350 yards away from the gas station. 18 problem is that within a mile and a quarter or two and a half 19 miles we got five liquor established already in Southfield. I've been there for 30 years, and I see that I don't want 20 21 another liquor establishment. I'm sorry. We have one at 22 greenfield road. Then we come down to the one here. We go down 23 to the middle -- there's four liquor establishments I could walk 24 to, and adding another one at a gas station, we said, we as the public, said that we're opposed to drinking and driving. 25

```
don't know. It sounds like drinking and driving to me. But I'm
 1
    opposed to, and that's all I have to say, okay.
 2
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your
 3
    thoughts.
 5
              MR. CHEW: Good evening. How are you all?
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Your name and your address.
              MR. CHEW: Marcus Chew. Address is 25040 Southfield
 8
    Road, Sam's Suit Factory.
 9
              Just wanted to let you guys know that the gas station
    just needs to stay in its lane, sell gas. If there's anything
10
11
    else you want to sell besides liquor, sell food or something
12
    like that, but you have a liquor store right here on 10 Mile
13
    right before Evergreen. You got the one, as the young men just
14
    stated, on 10 Mile in a Greenfield. Then, of course, as we
15
    stated, it was one right at the CVS. Amy's Liquor Store is a
16
    good spot. We don't really need it. It's as simple as that.
17
    Just let the gas station stay in its lane and sell gas. Simple.
18
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your
19
    thoughts. Is there anyone else interested in sharing their
20
    thoughts regarding PSLU23-0017?
21
              MR. CREW: Good evening.
22
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Good evening.
23
              MR. CREW: My name is Lionel Crew, C-r-e-w.
                                                           I live at
24
    19830 West 12 Mile, Unit 32, in Southfield, and my mom lives
    right close to this gas station. This was one of my favorite
25
```

```
gas stations to get repairs done years ago when they had a
 1
 2
    garage.
              I've worked in substance abuse, you know, in Berkeley,
 3
    and all the gas stations in Berkeley have liquor stores in them,
    and it's been my understanding that a lot of these people were
    getting caught because they were trying to get there at 7
    o'clock when it opened, when the regular traditional stores
    aren't open, are rushing there at 1:59 to get another drink, you
 8
 9
          And like people mentioned, I don't believe that these two
   know.
    things actually mix. I really miss that repair shop there, but
10
11
    as far as alcohol and a gas station being so close to having
12
    three on every corner, and that is a very congested corner, 10
13
    Mile and Southfield, and we just don't feel that it's necessary.
14
    And I would really like to have another repair shop in there.
15
    Thank you. That's all.
16
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your
17
    thoughts.
18
              Is there anyone else interested in sharing your
19
    thoughts regarding PSLU23-0017?
20
              MR. LAURI: How are you doing?
21
              My name is Dura Lauri. I stay at 24535 North
22
    Carolina.
              I'm against it. We don't need all these liquor stores
23
2.4
    in our community. It just going to make our community go down
    if you put that up there. It's already seen too many accidents
25
```

1 on 10 Mile and Southfield. We just don't need it up in there. That's all I have to say. Thank you. 2 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: 3 Thank you for sharing your thoughts. 5 Is there anyone else interested? 6 Please share your name and your address. MS. GRAVES: Adina Graves, 17193 Goldwin Drive, 8 Southfield, Michigan. 9 I've been living here for 27 years, and even though I do go to this gas station, it's very hard to get in and out of 10 11 it as it is, I feel like putting liquor there won't be a good 12 idea. We have all these other liquor stores everywhere, mile 13 radius. I just, I'm opposed to it. I don't want it to happen. 14 Thank you. 15 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your 16 thoughts. 17 Anyone else interested? 18 MR. OLIVER: Good evening. My name's Raymond Oliver. I live at 25425 Grand Concourse, and I agree with those who have 19 20 spoken before me. 21 All it's going to cause is more accidents. 22 not enough parking space there. I very seldom go to that gas 23 station because it's hard to get in and get out, and I think all 24 it's going to create is another problem if you're selling -people just trying to pull in just to get some liquor. It's 25

different if you're in the gas lane and going in and going out, 1 but I really thinking it will cause more confusions and more accidents. That's all I have to say. 3 4 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your 5 thoughts. 6 Is there anyone else interested in discussing PSLU23-0017? MS. JORDAN: Clarise Jordan 25610 Friar Lane. 8 9 I agree with all the people as well, basically what they have stated. It is very congested in that area, and it is 10 11 very hard to get in and out of that area as well. So I just 12 wanted to come up and speak, too, just to say that I totally 13 agree with what they're saying, especially at night, which is a concern for me because, you know, most people are drinking and 14 15 things like that, driving and things like that, and by it 16 getting dark early or whatever the case may be, it can cause 17 several hazards in that intersection there. So I just wanted to 18 express my views to you all. Thank you. 19 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you for sharing your 20 thoughts. 21 Anyone else interested? 22 MR. JOSEPH: Hello. My name Alante Joseph, and I live 23 at 24535 North Carolina Street in Southfield, Michigan. 2.4 And what everyone has said, I'm opposed to it and I don't agree with it. I think it's a very bad idea. It's always 25

```
1
    congested, like everyone has said, and the parking lot is
    definitely not big enough. It's not enough room to accommodate
 2
    gas buyers and alcohol buyers at the same time.
                                                     So I'm opposed
           I don't like it. I don't think it's a good idea.
   you.
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    Thank you for sharing your
    thoughts.
              Is there anyone else interested in PSLU23-0017?
 8
 9
    Anyone else interested in sharing their thoughts? Anyone else
10
    interested in sharing their thoughts?
11
              At this time, I'm going to close the public hearing
    for PSLU23-0017.
12
              Commissioner Martin?
13
14
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I have a question. Well, for
15
    the public hearing though, of course. For the site plan I have
16
    questions.
                                   Go ahead.
17
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
18
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: One of the things I know is that
    because of the liquor store, you're required to have a sign
19
    request requiring ID for the purchase of liquor, and you're also
20
21
    required to have a sign for the purchase of cigarettes.
22
    we need to make sure that this and any other gas station that
23
    wants to sell liquor has signage that says, that lets those
24
    entering know that they need required ID for cigarettes, beer,
    wine, and liquor. It's just something that we need to make sure
25
```

1 that they have. That's all. Okay. 2 Okay. Commissioner Willis? CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: 3 Thank you. I have a couple of COMMISSIONER WILLIS: questions. First of all, someone brought up, and I think it's a 5 good question, the idea of parking. Parking requirements for gas station for filling up with gas, it's a little different than leaving your car, going inside to get a product and leaving it. Have you studied at all the parking requirements and have 8 9 you made any changes to your parking as a result of that? 10 I believe we have met all the MR. SAMONA: 11 requirements that the planning department needed for the parking. And most of the time we're a convenience store. 12 It's 13 not a liquor store where a lot of people have just coming in for 14 liquor. We serve qasoline, as everyone's saying, we serve 15 snacks, we serve food. Our liquor sales are not going to be 80% 16 liquor sales like a liquor store is. Our sales are like 80% food and snacks and 10, 15, 20% alcohol. It's the convenience. 17 18 We're in the convenience industry. Liquor stores are in the 19 beverage industry. You know, it's like no difference than McDonald's and Burger King next to each other. They have their 20 21 own clientele. This guy has one. This guy has a Big Mac. guy has the Whopper. It's no difference. Our business is a 22 convenience business. So there's not going to be 90 people 23 24 walking in just to get liquor. It's more or less the person who's getting fuel, they pull up or they stay in their car, as 25

```
1
    they do now, to get snacks. They may want a bottle of wine, a
    bottle of liquor, and, you know, we've met the requirements for
 2
   parking as of right now. We're not expecting or should -- we
    have other locations that have it and it does not exceed the
    number of people coming in just for liquor. And we're meeting
    state times and requirements. As far as listing ages, as far as
   having a scanner, as far as registers not working before 7 a.m.
    or after 2 a.m., all that is handled.
 8
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE: What then about staffing?
 9
    many people do you have on staff today, and how many would you
10
11
   have assuming this is approved?
12
              MR. SAMONA: Again, we're, you know, 10, 15% increase
13
    so we may add one more personnel to the area and, you know, and
14
    that we hire within the local area.
15
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Griffis?
16
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: There's been a lot of
17
    opposition to gas stations this year, and there's also a lot of
18
    gas station businesses that try to come into the city of
19
    Southfield. And I don't think that's on trial here tonight.
    think for the benefit of everybody, this is a broad question,
20
21
    but can the planning department kind of succinctly identify the
    requirements for this approval, just for everyone's knowledge?
22
23
    There seems to be allowed to just not in my backyard comments,
24
    but this isn't -- I don't think any of us said we need more
    liquor stores in Southfield. I think it was passed down from
25
```

```
1
    the top down to our review. So I don't know if that's something
 2
    we could --
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Planner Croad, do you want to
 3
    address that?
 5
              MR. CROAD: Yeah.
                                 I'm going to defer to Mr. Paison.
    If you could just -- there are some special land use specific
    regulations dealing with alcohol sales at gas stations, and I'll
   have him --
 9
              MR. PAISON:
                          Unfortunately I don't actually have a
    copy of the code with me, but they meet all of the dimensional
10
    standards, and they also exceed the parking requirement by about
11
12
         So they're meeting all of those dimensional standards.
13
    This would not require any variances from the zoning board of
14
    appeals to proceed to proceed.
15
              THE DEPARTMENT: So this particular address was
16
    approved as a gas station when it was a gas station only.
17
    They're here again to be approved adding liquor, and they meet
18
    all the rules originally and they meet all the rules again.
19
              MALE SPEAKER: Yeah, I will reiterate that there's no
20
    additional parking requirements because we look at the entire
21
    retail space to determine what the parking needs are as well as
22
    the pumps so they meet the parking requirements. They're not
23
    adding in any additional square footage. They're just changing
24
    the inventory of what they're selling on the inside.
              Some of the special land use requirements I know, for
25
```

1 example, is that you can't have any exterior sales. If you have an ice chest it has to be accessible and it has to be on an 2 accessible route. So we can confirm what those requirements are, but there's the general special land use considerations with traffic and circulation, which has been reviewed, hours of operation, which are controlled by the state liquor. This is not liquor consumption on site. This is sales of beer, wine and liquor for consumption offsite. So we've vetted all those 8 9 And typically when we look at existing situations, they issues. want to expand or enlarge, we make sure that they're in 10 11 compliance with our zoning ordinance today, not what was 12 necessarily approved 10 or 20 years ago. 13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So I think to that 14 point, I don't see this as being a major magnet for someone to 15 buy alcohol. I think you only -- if you're already there, you 16 If you're down the road, you go there. If you're down the 17 other side of the road, you go there. So I think it feels like 18 an inconvenient location and site plan and it's congested. And 19 I don't personally go there. I'm very close to you. 20 personally avoid most gas stations in the city of Southfield. 21 It's just something I do. I don't know. They don't feel 22 comfortable to me, so I don't go there. But you meet the rules, 23 so I don't have any opposition to you. I don't think it's going 24 to -- I think Southfield Road has existed for 50 years or longer. There's already cars on the road. There's not new cars 25

```
because you start selling beer today. I don't think it -- I
 1
    don't think this changes, so I don't have an opposition to it.
 2
    I'm not for it. I'm not against it. I don't think it changes
    anything. That's all.
 5
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye?
 6
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: How much of an increase in
    traffic do you expect with the sales of alcohol?
              THE DEPARTMENT: With other operations that we've had
 8
 9
    in the past, it doesn't exceed probably less than 10%.
                                                            It's the
    people that are in within are shopping -- our original clients
10
11
    that come in that use it. It's not drawing so many more.
12
    Everyone has their own, you know, areas. You know, we're in a
13
            Sure, it's a traffic corner, but it's a traffic corner
14
    for everybody else on those four corners. It's no different
15
    than us. But the traffic does not increase according to what
16
    people are saying or thinking. It doesn't work like that.
    We're not taking 90% of the business from there. It's not even
17
18
   possible.
              If that was the case, you know, we didn't be here
19
    today. We would quit a long time ago. So it increases probably
    10% -- less than 10% if we get that, you know, on offbeat peak
20
21
    hours and offbeat hours. It's within the people that are
22
    already there that will use the convenience factor.
23
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS:
                                     To the Chair. I just wanted to
24
    note if you look at the recommended resolution for the special
    land use the first eight items are the standards for special and
25
```

```
use approval for this district. So those are the standards
 1
    you're supposed to consider when you decide what you're doing
   per the code. So if you want to read them right out, if they're
    in that recommended resolution, if you want to look at those for
    the -- the commissioners.
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Planner Croad would like to hear
           Could you please go through them?
    those.
              MALE SPEAKER:
 8
                             Sure.
 9
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Before you do that, let me make
    sure Commissioner Goodwin-Dye has concluded her questions.
10
11
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE:
                                         Yeah. I'm all done.
12
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah, I can give a quick summary of
13
    these.
14
              The first one is that the privileged use will be of
15
    such size and character that will be in harmony with the
16
    appropriate and orderly development of the general business
17
    district. Second is the location, size, intensity and periods
18
    of operation are designed to eliminate any possible nuisance
19
    likely to emanate therefrom which might be adverse to occupants
20
    of other -- any other nearby permitted uses. And that's
21
    specifically referring to nuisances. The proposed use is in
22
    accord with the spirit and purpose of this chapter and is not
    inconsistent with or contrary to the objective sought to be
23
24
    accomplished by this chapter, which would be the zoning
    ordinance and principles of sound planning. For the proposed
25
```

```
uses of such character and the vehicle traffic -- vehicle
 1
    traffic generated will not be have an adverse effect or be
    detrimental to the surrounding land uses or to the adjacent
    thoroughfares. Five, the proposed use of such character,
    intensity and range so as to eliminate any adverse effects
    resulting from noise, dust, dirt, glare, odor, or fumes. Six,
    the proposed use will be not adverse to the promotion of the
    health, safety and welfare of the community. Seven, the
 8
 9
    proposed use is designed and operated so as to provide security
10
    and safety to the employees and the general public. Eight, the
11
    recommendation, that's just a general -- that's actually seven
12
    is a general. Eight is just a recommendation that they be --
13
    that the approval be based on what they represented in terms of
14
    their plans and proposals.
15
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    Thank you.
16
              Commissioners, are there any other comments or
17
    questions?
18
19
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I think I -- if possible,
20
    Attorney Randy Samona addressed this a moment ago. If I could
21
    ask him a couple of questions, if I could.
22
                           Yes, sir.
              MR. SAMONA:
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: First of all, thank you for the
23
24
    report.
              MR. SAMONA:
25
                           No problem. Sorry I had to get it to you
```

```
guys last minute. It just took a while to compile, but I
 1
 2
    appreciate you reviewing it. Thank you.
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: A lot of work went into it.
 3
    you have a hypothesis that I think is interesting, and that is
 5
    .2 tenths of a mile.
 6
              MR. SAMONA:
                           I beg your pardon.
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: That has radius to evaluate
    whether or not there's a conflict or problem, you use two-tenths
 8
    of a mile?
 9
10
              MR. SAMONA:
                           Yes.
11
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: And I am wondering, is there a
    source that I could find the two-tenths of a mile? Is that like
12
13
    liquor control commission? Is there any commission or
14
    regulatory body that would suggest that number to restrict the
15
    number of, you know, sales locations?
16
                          The Michigan Liquor Control Commission
              MR. SAMONA:
17
    defers to city's municipalities to decide distances between
18
    locales.
              But, again, just chiming on even what the -- when the
19
    commissioner was reading the criteria.
20
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Excuse me. The public hearing
21
    has concluded. Commissioner Willis, you can ask your specific
22
    questions, but I'm sorry I'm not allowed to -- you can answer
23
    his question, but that's about all.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                   Okay.
25
                           I was in the course of answering that
              MR. SAMONA:
```

1 question, yes. COMMISSIONER WILLIS: So it's up to the City of 2 3 Southfield to determine, let's say, any zoning restriction? MR. SAMONA: With regards to proximity of locations? 5 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yes. 6 MR. SAMONA: Yes, it's up to the City. So I didn't find anything in the ordinance that had any number with regards 8 to how close they're supposed to be. 9 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. 10 MALE SPEAKER: And if I could through the chair? 11 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Yes. 12 MALE SPEAKER: When this was given to us to review and 13 make recommendations by the City Council, there were no distance 14 separations between retail sales of alcohol and liquor. 15 there is there is nothing on -- the City has the right to 16 determine and put those separations on, and counsel when they 17 approved this did not add that as one of the requirements. 18 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I don't doubt that. I'm just 19 wondering if there's anything we need to look at that would 20 limit a right of -- and so I just wanted to query if he had a 21 regulation and ordinance, you know, something --22 If I could, I've skimmed his packet. MALE SPEAKER: 23 Some of the information that he's referring to deals with, like, 2.4 establishments for on premise consumption. So I just want you to be aware that our charge is to look at what the requirements 25

of the ordinance is to allow, as the general special land use 1 requirements and any specific requirements dealing with alcohol 3 sales at gas stations. COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Do that again. I'm sorry. 5 THE DEPARTMENT: As planning commissioners, you need to consider the general requirements of the special land use that Mr. Paison had read. COMMISSIONER WILLIS: 8 Okay. 9 THE DEPARTMENT: And this is an existing facility that's already open 24/7, and their sales of alcohol are 10 regulated by the State within certain limits of hours. There's 11 12 no expansion to the existing facility that is conforming. 13 One of the specifics that I mentioned is that gasoline 14 filling station shall not have any outside storage or retail 15 display. Well, one of the requirements is if you have alcohol 16 sales you can't have outdoor ice chest unless they meet the 17 exterior ice chest requirements being barrier free. 18 So I'm just asking you to focus on what the ordinance requirements are before you, you know, when you make a decision. 19 20 And even though the applicants representative brought up a lot of relevant information, some of that information is not 21 22 pertinent to this particular case. 23 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. Forgive me. I'm looking 24 at proposal six -- I'm sorry -- recommendation six that talks about the general health, safety and welfare of the community. 25

And I would really wonder if in a situation like this, do you 1 know of any situations where you can document damage to the health, safety or welfare of a community when you had liquor --3 alcohol sales with this kind of density? 5 Yes. Mr. Commissioner, I actually noted that in the letter that I wrote to you guys that at tab eight, and I'll just read right here, it says, it's a report that was published by The US National Institute Of Health which 8 delineates public health concerns with alcoholism, alcohol 9 dependency, and underaged alcohol consumption in communities 10 11 with a more saturated alcohol outlet density of .1, .25 and .5 miles around respondents homes. So when I looked at that 12 13 information, and that's what I used to base the .2 mile radius 14 off of. 15 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay; okay. That gives me some 16 insight. Thank you. 17 MR. SAMOA: Thank you. 18 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you. Before we proceed, 19 there are several other people in the audience that want to 20 speak. Unfortunately, I've closed the public hearing for this 21 particular topic. If you would like to stick around, you have 22 another opportunity to share your thoughts and comments in item 23 G under public comment; okay. I just want to make sure that 24 everybody understands that. 25 Commissioners, are there any other comments?

Commissioner Martin? 1 2 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I would like to point out that 3 our job is to look at the zoning requirements and see that those things are meant. We have no control over the businesses, just that they meet requirements. So that's what we're doing. 6 you. THE DEPARTMENT: Can I also clarify the question and the answer? The State of Michigan has lifted the area of 8 9 competitive liquor licenses, number one. Number two, we are in a four way highway lane. Even before they lifted that zoning 10 11 you were allowed to have that because it is a four way license. 12 Just to clarify, so it does meet state requirements. It is not up to the city. It's up to this State. 13 14 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Thank you. 15 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioners, are there any 16 other comments? I'm ready to move on. 17 To the department, is there a recommendation for 18 PSLU23-0017 -- I'm sorry. 19 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Yes. I do want to say the 20 reason we hold public hearings is to get input from the public, 21 and we did receive some additional information --22 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. 23 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: -- at the late hour. And 24 you have fulfilled your requirements of holding the public hearing. I'm going to recommend that we post one to a date 25

```
certain of next month. We do respect the public's comments, and
 1
 2
    I do want to be able to answer your questions. So I'm asking
 3
    the commission to consider postponing to a date certain to give
    us time to review all the information that was presented tonight
    and that we can provide informed responses to the planning
    commissions questions.
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: What date?
 8
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Our next regular meeting
 9
    in January.
10
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                          10th.
11
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                          January.
12
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioners, the department is
13
    suggesting that we postpone a vote on -- are we going to do the
14
    site plan as well? You want to both; correct?
15
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                          Yes.
16
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: We're going to postpone the
    items regarding the property at 24848 Southfield Road,
17
18
    specifically PSLU23-0017 special use public hearing and
19
    PSP23-0017 site plan review to a date certain, which is January
    24, 2024. Is there a motion?
20
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
21
                                    So moved.
22
                                    Is there a second?
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
23
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                    Support.
2.4
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    It's been moved by Commissioner
    Martin and second by Commissioner Willis that we postpone to
25
```

```
date certain of January 24th, 2024, items related to 24848
 1
    Southfield Road, specifically PSLU23-0017 special use public
    hearing, PSP23-0017 site plan review. All in favor.
 3
              (All in favor)
 5
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Motion carried.
 6
              Thank you, gentleman.
              MR. SAMONA: Thank you. And we'll be prepared to
    respond to all the issues that were raised tonight.
 8
 9
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: All right. Moving right along.
    We're going to look at item E, 24960 Telegraph Road,
10
11
    specifically PZR23-0003 rezoning. It's a public hearing.
12
    PSLU23-0018 special use public hearing. PSP23-0018 site plan
13
             To the department, may I have some background, please?
14
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yes, ma'am.
                                            Sure.
                                                   This is the
15
    southeast corner of Telegraph and 10 Mile existing Marathon gas
16
             They are looking to do liquor sale edition as well.
    station.
17
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Hold on, Tom. Hold on; hold on.
18
    Okay. You may continue.
19
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yes, ma'am. As I said, this gas
    station is looking to add liquor sales as well, but also to do a
20
21
    building addition that will eventually accommodate a
22
    reconfiguration of the interior and a carryout restaurant.
    also need to do a rezoning. They're presently I1 industrial.
23
2.4
    Gas stations used to be permitted in that district, so they're
    not anymore. So it's not legal nonconforming. So to do an
25
```

addition or expansion, they need to -- would either need
variances, which we don't give use variances, so the property
would need to be rezoned to B3. Similar to the map we provided
previously, the blue circle is the current site. The red
diamond is a liquor store that's nearby, I think it's called The
Treasure Chest. Treasure Island.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Treasure Island.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE DEPARTMENT: Treasure Island, correct. And then there's another gas station kiddy corner across the intersection there with the orange oval within that 1,000 foot radius. Close up of the site, you can see the existing canopy gas station. The addition they're proposing would be on the north side of the building where those two parking spaces are at. Existing conditions on the site, here's some site photos of the configuration. Come on now. There we go. Existing zoning, as I noted, is I1. They are proposing a B3 zoning. It is B3 zoning north across 10 Mile, so that would be an expansion of the B3 district so it would now be considered spot zoning. And it is consistent with the future land use map. The commercial office would be consistent with the B3 and the gas station use and carryout and retail. Site plan, once again, in this case not making substantial changes to the site, but they are adding a sidewalk connection, adding bike racks, obviously the building addition on the north, freshen up the landscaping and move the handicap spaces to the south side of

```
1
    the building, as they had previously been on the north side of
    the building. We did do the parking calculation on this one as
           It also meets the parking requirement. I'll just note
              They did provide us with some more detailed floor
           On the right here you see where it says phase one would
    be without the addition. That's how they were going to
    reconfigure to handle the beer, wine and liquor sales in the
    short term, you know, immediately. And then if the -- when the
 8
 9
    addition is built the phase two on the left shows you how that
    would be reconfigured, again, to accommodate the changes.
10
    There's a little elevation rendering of the interior off to the
11
12
    right there that shows kind of the phase two finish look of that
13
    corner where the cashier would be with the liquor behind the
14
    counter, where the food counter would be, and then the racking
    in the middle elevations of the building. The main part of the
15
16
    building there on the right side is the existing elevation.
                                                                 The
17
    little bit taller square is the addition on the north side of
    the building. And then there's the view from actual 10 Mile on
18
19
    the right. Some photos of the interior, it shows mainly the
    area, like along the wall behind the counter where likely where
20
21
    the liquor would be going. I believe we also have the
22
    Petitioners present here if they would like to come up.
23
              MR. ESAM JAWAD: Hello, everyone. My name is Esam
24
    Jawad, 24960 Telegraph Road.
25
                                Hello, everybody. My name is
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD:
```

Justin Jawad. I'm Edam's son. 1 MR. PISOLKA: I'm Tom Pisolka. I'm the architect for 2 3 the project. 4 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Well, why don't you guys give us a little background? 6 MR. ESAM JAWAD: Like I stated last time before you, I've been there 21 years. Now it's 22 years this month. industry has been changing a lot. So I have to move on to get 8 9 the liquor license and beer and wine to be staying in business regarding electric cars was coming and all this industry, all I 10 11 see in other city is they not staying business is if they don't have combination to service their customer to be more 12 13 convenience for them in this situation. That's why I'm asking 14 to expand a little bit in my property and plus to have this 15 license to put in the city of Southfield. 16 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you. 17 MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: And I'd also like to chime in. 18 my father said, we've been there for 22; 21, 22 years. I was 19 born and raised in the city of Southfield, went to the old Buzzy 20 Center from Saint Mike's and so on. With the opportunity that 21 you guys have given us as far as having a liquor license and 22 being -- having the ability to sell liquor and then hopefully 23 also with the ability to add the addition, it gives us the 24 ability to compete against other businesses in the area.

guys know, electric vehicles have crushed our industry. There's

25

electric chargers in everybody's homes. We can't stop that. 1 There's electric chargers in office building spaces, in the 2 Meijer's parking lot. There's electric chargers everywhere. can't stop that. That's the inevitable. And for us to be able to stay competitive and to stay in business it's very crucial for us to be able to adopt and move on and be able to pivot into other different avenues of the area, and being able to sell liquor, beer, wine, spirits gives us that ability. As far as 8 9 the impacts of it, I feel like you guys have already done your 10 homework and studied those. Other cities have done their homework and studied those as well. So I don't think that's 11 12 necessarily too much of a conversation. People have to follow 13 People have to follow laws, and it's a two-way street. 14 We have to follow laws as well. So we have to make sure we're 15 not selling to minors. We have to make sure if somebody comes 16 in completely inebriated, that we're not selling to them, and 17 we're abiding by the rules of the State of Michigan. So as far 18 as all that is concerned, I don't think it's more of a problem. It's more of an opportunity for us to help us succeed and to 19 20 actually excel the City of Southfield. MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Maintain to be there for a long 21 22 time. 23 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you. At this time, I'd 24 like to open the public hearing for PZR23-0003, the rezoning. Is there any public here that is interested in sharing their 25

thoughts regarding PZR23-0003? Any public regarding PZR23-0003? 1 Any public regarding PZR23- 0003? Given none I'm closing the public hearing for PZR23-0003. 4 I'm opening the public hearing for PSLU23-0018, the 5 special use. 6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: For the chair. CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Yes. UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: We should act on the 8 9 rezoning first because if it -- we should take them 10 individually; okay? 11 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. 12 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: If you wouldn't mind. 13 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Not a problem. 14 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: So you could open up 15 discussion regarding the merits of the rezoning first. 16 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Correct. UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: And then once that has 17 18 been acted on, we can go to the next one. 19 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. All right. Commissioner 20 Martin, we're looking at PZR23-0003 the rezoning. 21 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: In your comment, you were 22 mentioning the EV, electric vehicles, being something that's 23 through --2.4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Through the Chair, Mr. 25 Martin, on this particular case, all we're considering is the

```
merits of the rezoning itself, not any specific site plan issues
 1
    or dealing with the gas station. So they're looking to rezone
 2
    the property from I1 industrial to B3, so if you want to have a
    discussion on the types of uses that are permitted in the I1
    versus what the B3. Regardless if the gas station is there or
    not, the rezoning itself is on the merits of rezoning to B3.
    Then once we get into the special land use and the site plan,
    you can ask specific site plan questions.
 8
 9
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: That brings a question to mind
    from me to you then. EVs, electrical outlets for EVs, is that
10
    for industrial and for B3, or is that --
11
12
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: That is a site plan issue.
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Okay. I gotcha. Okay.
13
14
    gotcha you there.
15
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: We're okay talking about
16
    whether or not you want this to remain as an industrial zoning
17
18
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Gotcha.
19
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Versus a B3, which is a
20
    commercial zoning, and all of the types of uses that are
21
    permitted in the commercial zoning.
22
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah.
23
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                          So any one of our
24
    industrial types of uses, in theory, if they had enough land
    could be built on here.
25
```

```
1
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Okay; okay. No questions at
 2
    this time.
 3
                                   Commissioner Willis.
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    Thank you. I hope I'm not
 4
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
    offending.
 5
 6
              You are going to have a restaurant; am I correct?
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD:
                                 Just a carryout.
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                          If I could; if I could.
 8
 9
   Mr. Paison, could you read the uses that are permitted in the
    requested B3 district?
10
11
              MR. PAISON: Yes.
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Can I borrow your code for
12
13
    just a second because I unfortunately --
14
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
15
              MR. PAISON: I'll do it.
16
              Again, through the Chair, we are considering going
    from industrial zoning to B3, which is general business. Uses
17
18
    permitted in the general business are medical offices, including
19
    clinics in medical laboratories, banks and similar financial
    institutions, post offices, private clubs, lodges, nursery
20
21
    schools, photographic studios, photographic reproduction,
22
    funeral homes, personal services, stores of a generally
23
    recognized retail nature, veterinarian clinics, public owned
24
    buildings, utility buildings, et cetera, establishments of
    trades like such as electricians and plumbers, heating
25
```

contractors, assembly halls, concert halls, religious 1 institutions and similar places of assembly, open air retail 2 sales, hotels, freestanding restaurants and carryout restaurants, accessory buildings and uses, health and fitness clubs. And then uses permitted subject to special approval include recreation centers, motor vehicle washing when completely enclosed building, gasoline stations. And outside there is specific requirements for gasoline stations, outside 8 storage, automobile repair and service facilities, automobile 9 truck sales, showrooms, drive-in fast food restaurants, open-air 10 11 display pawn shops, smoking lounge ages, shelters for homeless, 12 soup kitchens, sexually-oriented business, cabaret, and then 13 there's the marijuana provisioning centers and retail. 14 So this first subject is whether we want to keep it 15 industrial or consider rezoning to B3, because once this gets 16 rezoned somebody could come in here, tear the gas station down 17 and either build anything that's in the permitted uses or come 18 back for special land use. So all the questions should be 19 specific to the types of uses that could be permitted in the B3. 20 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I'm not sure. I thought the 21 restaurant was in that list, because the only thing I wanted to 22 know if it was cooking onsite or --23 MR. PAISON: But, again, regardless of what's there, 24 once it's rezoned somebody could come in the day after the rezoning and put any of the permitted uses. Once we get through 25

the rezoning and then we're dealing with the special land use on the gas station itself, that would be appropriate time to ask questions about how they're going to operate their carryout restaurant or retail sales or whatever.

COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Fine. I'll pass.

1

2

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Griffis.

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So pretty much every use we've reviewed on this commission since I've been here along Telegraph Road is not an allowed use. Somebody back in the day really screwed up the zoning along Telegraph Road, I think. This is not an industrial district. They were approved as an allowed Now, the City changed the rules on them. Now they have to come and get new approval again. So I don't think -- the B3 is what a gas station should be on a major intersection. Road is not an industrial park or corridor. It's everybody has to go through this extra hurdle to do business in the City of Southfield on Telegraph Road. Every time this comes in front of me I bring this up. I guess in theory the City's trying to get you -- I think this should be approved as a B3 slam dunk because it should have always been a B3. It's not an industrial park. So I don't think this is a long discussion, although I'm making it a long discussion because every building on Telegraph has to come and get this special approval to continue to exist or to reinvest in their building. It's unfair to real estate investors in the city of Southfield, but I think we make it

```
easy, but it's a hurdle that they have to jump through.
 1
 2
    I'11 --
 3
              MR. PAISON:
                           Yeah.
                                  If I could just to respond.
    Remember, this was a township at one time.
 5
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Yeah.
                                                   It's zoning.
 6
              MR. PAISON: And Telegraph was more inclined towards
    industrial uses, especially on South Telegraph Road. And then
    when we became a city. We adopted zoning ordinances, and so we
 8
 9
   have a lot of nonconforming situations or uses along there, and
    our job is to make them conforming. So in order to make this
10
11
    conforming, and we're supporting a rezoning to and then that
12
    would -- that B3s allow gas stations as special land uses and
13
    the liquor sales as special land uses.
                                            But before we do that,
14
    we have to get it conforming. Now, there is this, Mr. Griffis,
15
    there is these uses that are not related to manufacturing and
16
    production in the industrial district, and I think a lot of
    these probably preexisted the zoning or they got in under that
17
18
    not related to but that's really not the best way to do it. And
19
    so our job is to try to, again, make it as conforming as we can.
    To your point, this should be a B3 use. This is a corner.
20
                                                                Ιt
21
    looks, feels, tastes like a commercial intersection, but before
22
    we do that we have to get the zoning in place first and then we
    can deal with the special land use. Again, they can they can
23
24
    continue to be there as a nonconforming use, but they can't
    expand or enlarge the nonconformity, so that's why we have to go
25
```

through the rezoning.

1

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So I'm in favor of the rezoning. And I think the limited size of the site is going to -- if it ever comes to a different site plan will limit what can go in there. And I'm not going to try to predict the future right now.

CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Are there any other questions related to specifically the rezoning of PZR23-0003? Given none, is there a recommendation?

MR. PAISON: Yes, ma'am. The planning department recommends favorable recommendation of PZR23-003 to rezone the land at 24960 Telegraph Road from I1 industrial to B3 business for the following reasons: The Southfield comprehensive master plan indicates Southfield technology corridor use for this property, which includes interspersed commercial uses. request to rezoned from I1 industrial to B3 general business would meet the master plan's goals, policies and future land use map by allowing increased commercial use of this property along the Telegraph Road frontage. The proposed conditional rezoning -- sorry. Not a conditional rezoning. The proposed rezoning to B3 general business would allow for the existing site gas station, convenience store to exist as a conforming use and allow the additional uses permitted by the rezoning that would be compatible with other auto-oriented commercial uses that are -- dominate this part of Telegraph Road. And the site is likely

1	to remain a gas station or similar use, as it has recorded
2	restricted use covenants imposed by the State of Michigan due to
3	soil contamination related to its long history as a gas station.
4	So it's actually been a gas station since the 50s. Also, like
5	some of the other uses on I just note some of the other uses
6	on the B list, like the marijuana and some of the adult
7	regulated uses have spacing from residential that will be
8	precluded on this site because there is residential within those
9	distances. So they would not practically be usable, but we do
10	recommend favorable recommendation.
11	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a motion to accept?
12	COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: I'd like to make a motion for
13	favorable recommendation of PZR23-0003 rezoning.
14	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Second.
15	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner
16	Griffis and second by Commissioner Martin that we accept a
17	favorable recommendation for PZR23-0003. All in favor.
18	(All in favor)
19	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Oppose? Motion carries.
20	Moving on to PSLU23-0018 special use. To the
21	department.
22	THE DEPARTMENT: Yes, ma'am.
23	We do need to hold a separate public hearing on the
24	special use, or if you want to open that now.
25	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Do you want to give us some

1	background on the special use?
2	THE DEPARTMENT: The special use basically has the
3	similar standards as we discussed previously for the Southfield.
4	It has the same zoning. It would be B3 if the rezoning were
5	adopted. So it's those same seven standards that we were
6	discussing previously for reviewing a special land use. And in
7	this case, they don't have any outdoor ice chest. The
8	Southfield one had them, but they were going to do an ADA one
9	they had provided us in detail. This one does not have any ice
10	chest or other exterior storage currently and is not intending
11	to have it. They are looking to do some site improvements,
12	sidewalk connections, bike racks, landscape refreshing, you
13	know, but most of the work will be interior and then eventually
14	the addition to the building.
15	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. At this time, I'd like to
16	open the public hearing for PSLU23-0018, the special use.
17	Is there any public that would like to share their
18	thoughts or comments regarding PSLU23-0018? Any public
19	interested in sharing their thoughts regarding PSLU23-0018?
20	Given none I'm closing the public hearing.
21	Commissioner Martin.
22	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: No questions at this time.
23	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Willis.
24	COMMISSIONER WILLIS: No questions.
25	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Griffis.

1

2

3

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: It's strange that we have almost the exact same project two times in a row in the same night, so I feel like we need to make some of the same comments. I'm not for gas stations. I'm not against gas stations. one is a similarly small congested corner, but it was approved at the time. Just thinking about this today, though, again there's three curb cuts on this very small site on this very small angle, and this the northernmost curb cut, it seems like that would not be approved if we were doing this again today. So assuming we're going to consider this one longer like we did the previous project, I'd like to take -- or staff to take a closer look if that northwest curb cut should be eliminated for safety reasons to limit the flow of traffic. We talked about rezoning, or the special use. You know, they appear to be meeting all the other special use criteria with the barrier free improvements and connectivity and the minor improvements to the flow of the site. So I'm thinking they're meeting the requirements of the special use.

CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Planner Croad.

MR. CROAD: Yeah. Just to Mr. Griffis's comment. The Telegraph Road is under the jurisdiction of MDOT and 10 Mile is under the jurisdiction of the Road Commission of Oakland County, and they have the right to issue access via drives. Our new deputy city engineer is trained in transportation engineering, and Mr. Paison can correct me, but he is now involved in all of

```
our reviews, so I believe he signed off on it. But those are
 1
    good comments, and we do look at those, but ultimately the
    applicant would have to -- as you know, on other redevelopments,
 3
    just because the curb cut is there doesn't mean that they're
    going to get permitted to keep it. But I do know there's three
    different agencies reviewing these driveway access in this
   particular case.
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Which is no fun, and I hate to
 8
 9
    suggest that but --
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. And just for the Chair, one of
10
11
    the things that makes Telegraph a little different is it's
12
    boulevarded. It's right turn in, right turn out only. There's
13
    no left at that driveway, so it's a little different animal than
    the one at Southfield where you do get left turns going on.
14
15
    the case of Telegraph because it's boulevarded it is a more
16
    controlled traffic situation.
17
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Good point.
18
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               Thank you.
19
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye.
20
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE:
                                         No questions.
21
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin.
22
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You were mentioning before about
23
    the things that you -- some of the reasons you were expanding,
2.4
    and one of the things you mentioned was the electric vehicles.
    I don't notice any electrical vehicle plugs on your new floor
25
```

plan. Do you have any plans on the adding EV --1 MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: At this time, no, we don't have it. 2 3 But we are considering them. It's just that the ones that are out as far as for a commercial place, they're not as efficient as the ones that we need them to be. Like the ones that are at home or the ones that are in parking lots or hotels, they have a longer charge time. So they charge anywhere from, like, three to four hours to six hours. And the ones that are currently out 8 9 there they're still like a half hour charge time. So like for somebody to be coming and parking on the pump or in a parking 10 11 space for a half hour, 40 minutes, that hurts our business. So 12 as of right now, no, but until they come out with stronger 13 chargers, more efficient chargers, where we can get a car in and 14 out in five minutes, ten minutes then, of course, we would 15 definitely have that because that would be comparable to what 16 fuels and gasoline is. 17 MR. ESAM JAWAD: That's another thing we worry about 18 it to bring more convenience to the store. We can generate more 19 income with liquor, with beer and wine and combinations and for 20 all what the customer asking about it, you know. So it would be 21 something like in and out to grab something they need and leave. 22 It's not like they come exactly to shop at the liquor store. 23 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Is there a 2.4 recommendation? 25 THE DEPARTMENT: If I could.

1	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Oh, I'm sorry.
2	THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. Could you state the hours of
3	operation of your proposed restaurant, or your take out?
4	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Is it 7 a.m. to 8 p.m.?
5	THE DEPARTMENT: And that's seven days a week?
6	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Probably Sundays will be short.
7	THE DEPARTMENT: Well, we this is part of the
8	special land use can dictate hours of operation. So we would
9	like you to tell us what you prefer.
10	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Sure. Yeah.
11	THE DEPARTMENT: And then the approval will be subject
12	to you meeting those hours of operation.
13	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: I understand. So like 10 a.m. to 8
14	p.m
15	THE DEPARTMENT: 10 a.m
16	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: on Sundays.
17	THE DEPARTMENT: to 8 p.m. on Sunday.
18	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: And 7 to 8 Monday through Saturday.
19	THE DEPARTMENT: 7 to 8, Monday through Saturday.
20	Okay.
21	MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Correct. Yeah.
22	THE DEPARTMENT: Thank you.
23	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin.
24	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: What would be your hours of
25	operation for liquor sales?

```
1
             MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: So those would be according to the
    State guideline. So as the State has indicated, you're only
    allowed to sell liquor between 7 a.m. and 2 a.m., and then
    following that, there's no sales. And then Sunday morning, it's
    from 12 to 2, but then there's an extra purchase or license or
    whatever it is that you're allowed to have to be able to enable
    you to have sales from 7 a.m. So whatever the State quidelines
    are, we would be following those.
 8
 9
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Okay. Here again, like Mr.
    Croad said we have to specify the hours.
10
11
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: So 7 to 2 Monday through Saturday,
    and 7 to 2 with the extra certification. 7 to 2 on Sundays as
12
    well.
13
14
              THE DEPARTMENT: So Mr. Paison can include as the
15
    condition of approval that the hours of sales of beer, liquor
16
    and win will be subject to the State's --
17
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Requirement.
18
              THE DEPARTMENT: So at least that part's covered. The
19
    carryout is a different hours of operation. And you're 24/7?
20
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Correct.
21
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. So the overall store, C store
22
    gas station is 24/7. The carryout is 7 a.m. to 8 p.m. Monday
23
    through Saturday. 10 a.m. to 8 p.m. on Sundays. And then the
24
    liquor is 7 a.m. to 2 a.m. Monday through Saturday, and then
    whatever the Sunday allocation. And we can immortalize that in
25
```

```
recommendations to Council.
 1
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Along with their license
 2
 3
    approval?
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah, that -- I mean, yeah, that is
 5
 6
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
              THE DEPARTMENT: -- that is subject to license
 8
    approval from both the City and the State.
 9
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioners, are there any
10
    additional questions? Is there a recommendation?
11
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               Yes, ma'am. The planning department
12
    recommends favorable recommendations of the special use request
13
    for -- from Tom Pisolka representing Esam Jawad to permit the
14
    building addition and addition of liquor sales and carryout
15
    restaurant to existing gas station on the property, 24960
16
    Telegraph Road. The general conditions of special land use that
17
    we discussed previously, harmonious, consistent in character,
18
    not causing a nuisance, reasonable traffic circulation, not
19
    causing nuisances for dust or glare or odor, and not adverse to
20
    health safety, welfare. Proposed use to provide for security
21
    and safety of the employees and the general public. And that
22
    the recommendation based on the documents, facts,
23
    representations, stipulations submitted with the application and
24
    placed on the record at the public hearing by the Petitioner and
    their representatives. And we have conditions subject to the
25
```

```
approval of PZR23-0003 by the City Council, which is the
 1
    rezoning, subject to approval of the site plan BESP203-0018 by
 2
    City Council, subject to approval to the required setback
    variances by The Zoning Board Of Appeals that were noted in your
    report. They would need a building setback from 10 Mile and a
    building setback from the rear from the zoning board of appeals,
    and would be subject to continuous, also any recommendations of
    the Southfield Police Crime Prevention Bureau regarding site
 8
 9
    security and continuous compliance with all of applicable
10
    ordinances, codes, laws, and statutes. Petitioner must perform
11
    work under plans, permits and final inspections by the City of
12
    Southfield. And the hours of operation previously discussed
13
    will be incorporated.
14
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a motion?
15
    Commissioners, is there a motion?
16
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: I'd like to make a motion for
17
    favorable recommendation of special use PSLU23-0018.
18
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                    Support.
19
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner
    Griffis and supported by Commissioner Willis that we accept a
20
    favorable recommendation for PSLU23-0018. All in favor?
21
22
              (All in favor)
                                    Oppose? Motion carried.
23
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
2.4
              Moving right along, we're going to look at PSP23-0018,
25
    the site plan review. Is there any additional information from
```

```
1
    the department or the staff regarding this?
 2
              THE DEPARTMENT: No, ma'am.
 3
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Commissioners, do you
    have any questions? Commissioner Martin.
 5
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Not at this time.
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                   Commissioner Willis.
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I started asking about your
    restaurant, and you said it was just carryout food. Will you do
 8
 9
    food preparation at all onsite, or will this be like packaged
    food from another source?
10
11
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD: Everything will be packaged onsite.
12
    So it'll be either to order where, you know, a customer comes
13
    in, they put the order. It's typically going to be ready-made
14
    food. So comfort food as far as french fries, chicken tenders,
15
    and pizza, and some deli sandwiches. Some of that may be
16
    packaged and put into the deli cooler, but that's the extent of
17
        We're not running like a -- you know -- a five star
18
    restaurant or something. Even though it'll taste like a five
19
    star restaurant it's going to be small and easy and lean and
20
    mean, that's about it.
21
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. I can't think of anything
22
    now.
                                    Okay. Commissioner Griffis.
23
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
2.4
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you for reminding me it's
    the boulevard situation on Telegraph that makes it a lot more
25
```

```
safe for traffic. So I retract my earlier comment about
 1
    removing a driveway. I think the small addition, when you see
    the two floor plans, it really improves the flow of their
    business and handicap accessibility looks like on the inside,
    and so I think that's a good reason to allow the improvements.
    They're checking all the boxes on the site plan requirements and
    connectivity to the sidewalks and all the things that we ask
    everybody for. And there's mention of a variance requirement
 8
 9
    along 10 Mile. And it looks like, if I'm reading this
    correctly, the building just to the east of them is very close
10
11
    to 10 Miles. So, again, that doesn't bother me to kind of fill
12
    in the corner.
13
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               I believe it's because gas stations
14
    have a specific different setback from the general setback.
15
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS:
                                     Okay.
16
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               And that's what's triggering that.
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay.
17
                                            That's all.
18
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye.
19
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No questions.
20
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: I just have one comment as it
21
    relates to the neighboring liquor store. I think at our site at
22
    our study session, you all had a conversation with that
23
    proprietor. Can you share some background about that for public
2.4
    record?
25
                                        It was just a simple
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD:
                                 Yeah.
```

```
1
    conversation of where we had a good relationship with the owners
    from before, you know, they were great people, good
 2
    relationship. And then when they went to go sell, the new
    owners came in. We actually knew them from previous to that.
    And we just we told them, you know, the City of Southfield is
    going along this road, as many other cities are, where they're
    going to be allowing this ordinance of liquor inside gas
    stations and beer and wine. And he literally looked at us and
 8
 9
    said, you know, good luck, wish you the best. We're a specialty
    store. We know what we know, and you guys are going to be a
10
    convenience. And that was it.
11
12
             CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: All right. Thank you.
13
              Is there a recommendation?
14
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yes, ma'am.
                                            Yes, it's right here.
15
          The planning department recommends favorable
    Okay.
16
    recommendation of the site plan request for the addition and
17
    liquor sales and carryout at the gas station at 24960 Telegraph
18
    Road. All the developed features are located so as to minimize
    the possibility of any adverse impacts on adjacent properties
19
20
    and to relate properly to pedestrian vehicular traffic safety.
21
    Site plan does not show that access is provided -- or does show
22
    that access is provided only to major or secondary
23
    thoroughfares, in this case, 10 Mile and Telegraph and has a
24
    proper relationship with those roads for traffic safety.
    the recommendation is based on the documents, facts,
25
```

```
1
    representations, stipulations submitted with the application and
    placed on the record at the public hearing by the Petitioner and
    their representatives. We are recommending conditions, once
    again, that the PZR23-003, subject to the prove that rezoning,
    subject to the approval of the special land use by City Council,
    subject approval to the required setbacks by the zoning board,
    the site and building to be developed in accordance with the
    plan set that's before you dated November 9th, and the
 8
    Petitioner to implement any recommendations from the Southfield
 9
10
    Police Crime Prevention Bureau for site security and continuous
11
    compliance with all applicable ordinances, codes, laws,
12
    statutes, and the Petitioner must perform all work under plans,
13
    permits and final inspections by the City of Southfield.
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Is there a motion number?
14
15
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: I move that we accept the
16
    favorable recommendation of PSP23-0018.
17
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a second?
18
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Second.
19
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner
20
    by Goodwin-Dye and second by Commissioner Martin that we accept
    a favorable recommendation for PSP23-0018. All in favor?
21
22
              (All in favor)
23
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Motion carries.
2.4
              Thank you, Gentlemen.
25
              MR. JUSTIN JAWAD:
                                 Thank you.
```

```
1
             MR. ESAM JAWAD:
                              Thank you. Thank you, Jeremy.
 2
    time you want to the gas station you come to my gas station.
    It's very easy.
 3
 4
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: No; no; no.
                                                  I'm going to ride
 5
   my bike.
 6
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                   Moving right along. We're going
    to take a look at the minutes. Background on the minutes,
 8
   please.
 9
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: All right. Yes, ma'am.
    We've got the minutes from October 11th, October 25th regular
10
11
    meeting, the November 15th study meeting. We had a study
12
    meeting in November, so we didn't actually approve any minutes
13
    from October. So we've got to kind of clean up the -- the
14
    approval of the October and the November meetings. I will note
15
    that the October 25th meetings, because that was a regular
16
    meeting and we've moved it, doing transcripts is a chunky
17
    document because it's not just a like a summary minutes, it's a
18
    transcript done by a court reporter. So it is a much more
19
    thorough and complete document. We will be doing that going
20
    forward with regular meetings. It was recommended by our legal
21
    department. It was something that was done previously. And
22
    we're returning to that practice. Planet Pro got this budget
23
    for that for this year, so that's what you'll be seeing for your
24
    regular meeting minutes is those transcripts, whereas the study
    meetings needed to be cumulative in terms of their minutes.
25
                                                                 But
```

```
we do need to get the three of those approved, ideally this
 1
 2
    evening.
 3
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: And just as a note, I have
    in my packet two summaries and an actual transcript with some
    lines delineating, you know, making some changes.
 6
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Yeah, we had mistakenly
   had titles on there. Unfortunately, I had a roster that was a
    little out of date that got to the transcriptionist and we had
 8
 9
    the vice chair misidentified, so we were correcting that.
                                                               I've
    corrected the roster since then and provided an updated roster
10
11
    to the transcriptionist.
12
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: And I would support that,
13
    yeah.
14
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a motion?
15
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: To the Chair. I'd like to
16
    approve -- I'm sorry. I motion to approve the minutes of
17
    October 11th, November 25th for the study meeting, the October
18
    11th for the study meeting and the transcript for October 25th
19
    as corrected.
20
              COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Support.
21
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner
22
    Martin and second by Commissioner Griffis that we accept the
23
    minutes of October 11th, 2023; October 25, 2023; November 15th,
2.4
    2023. And there was another one. What was the other one?
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
25
                                    No.
                                         Two --
```

1	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Oh, That was it?
2	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Corrected.
3	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Corrected.
4	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: The 25th; October 25th.
5	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: The corrected 25th.
6	All in favor?
7	(All in favor)
8	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Motion carried.
9	Moving towards public comment. Given that there's
10	nobody here but us now, we're going to skip this section. We're
11	now on item H, Council item update, Planner Pros.
12	THE DEPARTMENT: Well, I believe we gave you an update
13	from the earlier session. And this upcoming Monday the planning
14	department is making a presentation on make food not waste.
15	It's about recycling of food waste or to reduce the amount that
16	are going into our landfill. That's our only planning item for
17	this month.
18	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Next on our agenda is
19	item I under miscellaneous, and the department has quite a few
20	items here. Have at it.
21	THE DEPARTMENT: Yes. Before we go into our formal, I
22	just I know Mr. Paison had prepared a brief description of
23	the Michigan liquor licenses for you.
24	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Uh-huh; yes.
25	THE DEPARTMENT: So what we were dealing with tonight

```
is considered specially designated merchant SDM, and that is for
 1
    convenience stores, grocery stores and gas stations. And note
    that no local legislative approval is required for this license.
    We will make sure that our conditions and recommendation is
    subject to the Michigan liquor licensing being approved for a
    specially designated merchant. But unlike other liquor sales on
    premises that does require local city approval, these do not.
 8
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    Thank you.
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Yeah.
 9
                                                 Those summaries
    were kindly provided by the City attorney. She had used them
10
11
    with regard to the legislative committee at the Council, so it's
12
    good information.
13
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                          It is.
14
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               Talking about the annual report, I'm
15
    going to come to the center podium here.
16
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    Okay.
17
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               Make sure I've got mic pickup here.
18
              All right. So we're doing the 2023 annual reports.
19
    This was your last meeting in of the month. We didn't think
    there'd be any new stuff sneaking in afterward, hopefully.
20
21
    this first slide just discussed the requirement to have an
22
    annual report that's in the Zoning Enabling Act. Just, you
23
    know, why are we doing this? It's a requirement of the law.
24
    It's also a good practice at the end of the year to kind of sum
    up where you been and what you've done in order to think about
25
```

what you want to do next. We do have just kind of an overview 1 of the structure here. You got, obviously, the Commission and 2 then the planning department staff work as a team. We do a lot of activities. We're going to talk about a lot of the activities we do here kind of as an overview. The first thing coming up here, just all of the meetings. You know, there were 24 planning commission meetings this year. You know, it's been a busy year. 10 study meetings, 12 regular meetings, 2 8 9 long-range study meetings. And then in addition to that, the 10 planning staff also works with the administers of the City 11 Center Advisory Board, that's Planner Croad primarily with Planner Bollin's assistance. We also do the Public Arts 12 13 Commission. That's another one that we work with, and then the 14 Sustainable Southfield Advisory Board, which is a relatively new 15 body that came out of our Sustainable Southfield Master Plan. 16 We've now stood that body up to provide assistance moving that 17 agenda forward. And then we don't administer the zoning board 18 of appeals, but Sarah Mullaly in our office provides them with 19 reports and some professional advising. One of the big things we've done is a fair number of zoning amendments. 20 I was 21 counting these and there's over a dozen, I believe, depending on 22 exactly how you count them and how they were clustered, you 23 would come up with about 15. So we looked at some uses we've 24 added; data processing centers, liquor sales in gas stations, heavy equipment sales, government facilities with outdoor 25

storage. We've done a couple of definition corrections, like 1 the city planner. We corrected some fence ordinance problems that were causing a lot of our residents who had corner lots serious problems because they were applying the structure setback of 25 feet to the fences. We actually increased the lot coverage allowed for single family residential from 25 to 30%, which hopefully will eliminate a bunch of zoning amendments, or zoning variances by the Zoning Board Of Appeals. 8 Just some minor corrections like public art in front yards, and a few 9 10 other cleanup items, the ice chests and those having to be ADA 11 accessible, and adding -- expanding Northland overlay district to include 16025 Northland Drive. Just kind of an overview. 12 13 It's actually quite a diverse list of things that we've engaged 14 in terms of zoning amendments. 15

Looking at commission review, just sort of other activities. Obviously, there was a visiting session for 2023 for the planning commissioners. You had a joint session with the City Council, which is something we will need to do in 2024 again. That's part of our redevelopment of ready communities is that should happen at least once annually. I think we're targeting, you know, after the holidays but, you know, before spring, we're look looking to get that on the calendar. It's a little busy because of the CIP and budget issues going on as well, but we'll figure it out. We've been providing regular reports on the Council actions. When the Council takes actions,

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 we're reporting back to you to let you know, you know, more consistently what's going on so you get that feedback loop. 2 Capital improvement program plan is something that the planning 3 department really helps administer. It'll come to this body, obviously for hearings, as it is required to by law for 5 recommendations, then to City Council. That's just kicking off kind of right now. Probably will really get rolling right after the holidays. Planning departments had some staff transition, 8 hired a planner one, hired the deputy city planner. We had 9 10 Assistant City Planner Spence retire, and then Planner Croad was involved in interviewing the new DDA director who has been 11 12 chosen and appointed and is coming on board pretty soon. 13 Then we had the LTU summer camp, which has been for a 14 few years now. Many of these photos are the students who are 15 involved. Ed in the summer camp. A very successful program, 16 very positive program that's, you know, doing all right. then hopefully to grow it, I believe, and get some more students 17 18 involved. 19 We had some research that was done on a accessory dwelling units, mother-in-law houses, tiny homes. 20 That's one of 21 the things we want to talk about in this coming year in a little more detail. Honey bee and poultry research, and we've had a 22 23 lot of interest from members of the public coming forward on 24 this urban agriculture topic. So that's another one we're going to talk about probably this year. 25

The Wildlife Commission, the Council are also interested in seeing maybe some movement on that.

1

2

3

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

We're going to continue to try to move the site plan review authority discussion that we started in November -- or you started previously but we had again in November. I'll be bringing that back again with some of the additional information that was requested at that.

And then the professional offices as a permitted use in the B zoning districts. We're going to come back with a more kind of complete comprehensive analysis comparing the various districts and their uses for you, provide that as well. probably going to try to get those two on a study meeting in January or February at the latest. It depends how much I can jam through the -- how much of the additional research I can get done over the next two weeks. I really want to talk a little bit and highlight our sustainability efforts since the master plan was adopted. The advisory boards been stood up. force of employee key employees has been stood up. A number of additional like some grants and some additional programs are getting moving. We've done some survey work. So this has really been launched. It came off the master plan being adopted, and we've got Suzanne Hannah, who's our sustainability planner, really moving the forward and involved in getting that forward. We're hoping to get a draft of that sustainability plan out there for, you know, more complete look at sometime

maybe later this year. It's an ambitious goal, because it's a 1 kind of a big undertaking, but she's working on it. And then as 2 you can see we've looked at the -- she's involved the EV smart program. We've had some tree grants we've gotten. We're doing the pollinator by the butterfly sculpture over by Eaton Core. Did those solder bollards over by Red Poll Park. Those actually came out of a -- someone did the product development out of the LTU accelerators. That was kind of a nice local synergy there, 8 9 working on getting certified maybe as a Michigan green 10 community. And I had just actually introduced Ms. Hannah to the 11 lead for communities, which is a new standard, that you can get 12 your actual community or your city lead for existing city 13 certified at various levels. It's a nice scoring system that 14 could give you some good metric. So it's a variety of fronts 15 we're working on, but it's very exciting and it's coming along. 16 So it's, we haven't been sitting on our hands since the master 17 plan was adopted. This is all kind of getting stood up over the 18 last several months. 19 The staff has been getting a fair amount of training, very active lately, the national planning conference, I believe 20 21 Terry, you attended that. And then we had staff members that 22 attend the Michigan Planning Annual Conference. We've also had 23 planners go to the Spring Institute and the Transportation 24 We've been to Oakland County events and trainings and cog events, and the National Brownfield Conference, which was in

25

```
Detroit. And Terry and, I believe, Administrator Croad -- or
 1
    Administrator Zoran did a presentation about Northland for that.
 2
    So that was very exciting. We got to look, and got some press
    on that.
             We were in Crain's. That gave us a lot of coverage.
 5
              Looking at the 2023 planning commission and department
    activities, just some summaries on the land use activities or 1
    rezoning for conditional rezoning, so 5 rezonings total, 17
    special land uses, 19 site plans, 1 ODD, 6 text amendments.
 8
 9
   Now, the text amendments included pieces, that's how we get to
    15 because some of those included multiple parts on different
10
    topics. And then 46 administrative site plan reviews processed.
11
12
    So all together, the proposed development value, a little over
13
    78,000,000. Comparing it to last year, 300,000,000, it seems
14
    low, but 250,000,000 of last year's was Middle Point, the Middle
15
    Point project by itself. So if you take Middle Point out of the
16
    picture, it was 50,000,000 compared to 78,000,000 this year.
    And that's the administrative site plan work and the stuff that
17
18
    came to the commission. So, you know, I would say a healthy
19
    amount of growth. Middle Point, I think, is still progressing,
    but they're -- look at the funded gap there. They're looking
20
21
    for some -- to work out their financing a little bit.
22
              Just some high project highlights. We just wanted to
23
    kind of show some of the projects we've looked at this year and
24
    highlight. The Clean Express Car Wash on Southfield that was
    approved, $5,000,000 of value there; the Culvers on Southfield,
25
```

```
that's 1.2 million dollar project; the Habitat For Humanity on
 1
    Westland Drive; another 1.2 million Finding Affordable Housing;
    Northland Storage ODD, that's rehabbing that AT&T building
    that's over there, putting it back into use and maybe having
    mixed use on the remainder of the site where the parking lot is;
    the Jasmine Square on Lasher; and McAllister Machinery on
    Telegraph, another million dollar project; and then the Matic
    Auto Wash, which was here recently, that's a demo of a derelict
 8
 9
   building and redevelopment of the site, about 4,000,000; and
10
    then the new gas station that was recently approved at
    Northwestern and 12 Mile on that corner at 1.4 million.
11
                                                            We got
12
    our cigar bar/restaurant, private club where Bacca was at,
    that's a major remodel and facelift on of that building for
13
14
    $4,000,000; and then the new storage building at the DPW
15
    facility on Clara Lane. So we do -- one of the things we
16
    actually want to discuss, as I've just summarized it, is this
    list here it's highlighted because this is the list of
17
    initiatives that were in the 2023 -- for 2023 in the 2022
18
19
    report, and we wanted to go through this list with you and see
    which of these things we need to continue to move forward, talk
20
21
    about which ones have been addressed and maybe what we might
22
    want to add to it for the coming year, because one of the things
23
    this report is supposed to include is recommendations for
24
    priorities for the coming year. So it's definitely worth
25
    discussing. And in some ways this is kind of the meat and
```

```
potato of like, well, okay, this is what we've done, but what
 1
    are we doing next? So I think that's -- that's the summary of
    it. And I think we can just -- if we want to have a little bit
    of a -- if the Chair wants to kind of conduct a little bit of a
    roundtable discussion on these items and which items stay, which
    items go and which items might need to be added that would
    really help the staff to kind of tune this in and know where we
    need to prioritize our work in the coming year to make sure the
 8
 9
    commission's priorities are being addressed. And that's what I
10
    have for the presentation.
11
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. I'm looking for the list
12
    so we can get started on it.
13
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               The packet, the front page looks like
14
    this.
15
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                    Okay.
16
              THE DEPARTMENT: Oh, I didn't include the old
17
    initiatives in the new report. It was included in the
18
    PowerPoint for discussion, but I didn't want to include the old
19
    list in the new report because obviously this is the new report,
20
    but --
21
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: We don't want to --
22
              THE DEPARTMENT: I can go through the list. I can
23
    just read them off --
2.4
              UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER:
                                         We don't want to prejudice
         I'd like to just see, are the things that you would like
25
```

to focus on, for us to focus on. If it's already on there,
we'll keep it on there. I can tell you like, for example, the
potential expansion of the mixed use corridor district, that was
done.

MR. PAISON: Right.

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE DEPARTMENT: So some of these things we've completed. We just want to get some input from you on areas that you would like us to focus on. We have some of our priorities, and we'll just combine those when we present to Council. So you can look at this list as a prompt, but we're really looking for if you have any particular areas that you would like us to focus on this coming year. We have a changing Businesses are changing. We're always trying to stay I think the one thing that I'm proud of, if you look at comprehensively all the training that our team has gone to, is we try to be abreast of best practices, and we're constantly bringing new information back to the team, to the Commission, to the City and we are proactively updating our ordinance. then sometimes we have to pivot because of situations such as Council wanted alcohol sales at gas stations that was previously prohibited, and we had to pivot when we had too many dollar stores, so we had to come up with some regulations. We had to pivot when -- was it caregiver marijuana became medical marijuana became recreational marijuana. So there are some things that are always out of our control. But there are things

```
like accessory dwelling units that we've talked about,
 1
    mother-in-law apartments that might be a good idea to help
   provide more affordability and increase in density.
 3
 4
              As Mr. Paison had indicated, we're going to be looking
    at urban agriculture and reviewing that this upcoming year, but
    there might be other topics that each of you are either
    interested or aware of or said, you know, I've been reading
    topics in the newspaper and you would like us to work on. So
 8
    that's what we'd like to save a few minutes and get some input
 9
    from you, and then we'll compile that with our wish list before
10
11
    you adopt and make a recommendation to present this to Council.
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin.
12
13
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                    I just have a couple of things.
14
    I didn't notice on there, but maybe I just didn't see it, was we
15
    talked -- we had some things going on with the 9 Mile corridor
16
    and with the 11 Mile corridor. We met over at -- in Oak Park, I
17
    think it was --
18
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. The 9 Mile task force is
19
    actually meeting next week.
20
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah.
21
                               They're pulling together to do that.
              THE DEPARTMENT:
22
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I was just saying those are
23
    things I didn't -- I might have just missed them.
2.4
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. So we have that general
    comment of nonmotorized transit, public transit neighborhood
25
```

```
enhancements, but to your point since we had this general
 1
 2
    vision --
 3
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                   Yeah.
              THE DEPARTMENT: -- we now have the 9 Mile corridor
 4
    task force that Mr. Paison and I will be attending next week.
    Plan was adopted, as we've reported to you before. Now we're
    focusing on implementation.
              MR. PAISON: And the 11 Mile thing was we went was
 8
 9
    they had to have like a kind of a public input meeting as part
10
    of a grant application --
11
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                   Yeah.
                                           To go through it, yeah.
12
              MR. PAISON: -- they were applying for. We applied
13
    for the same grant on other projects, and no one's really
14
    expecting to hear back on that grant until January, February,
15
    because it's a federal grant. It takes them time to process
16
           There's a lot of federal grant money out there, but it's
    that.
17
    also a lot of people applying for those buckets of money.
18
              THE DEPARTMENT: But I think to the point is when we
    list activities for 2024, Tom, we can specifically say 9 Mile
19
    corridor, 11 Mile corridor.
20
21
                           Sure. Yeah; yeah. We can list those.
              MR. PAISON:
22
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yesterday I had a joint meeting with
23
    Oak Park. We're going to be focusing on shared beautification
24
    of Greenfield between 8 and 9 Mile. So we can include the
    Greenfield Road beautification as one of our priorities for
25
```

2024. 1 Yeah. We could almost use the header and 2 MR. PAISON: 3 just add the subtopics as specific focus areas so that we know, like, yeah, we're -- you know, because I always say if everything's important, nothing's important. So like you say, yeah, we want to do these enhancements, but here's what we're focusing on right now to get some impact. But if there are other topics -- like I know Commissioner Griffis was just 8 9 commenting on, like, he sees a pattern of zoning issues that comes up over and over again before this Commission, those would 10 11 be good things to say, you know, what, we want to engage that 12 issue. Like the thing we saw with general office in the 13 districts being either not permitted or a special use. 14 the sort of thing, if, you know, if the Commission sees those 15 patterns and thinks they should be addressed, like that's the 16 kind of direction we're also looking for. CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin, do you have 17 18 any other comments? 19 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I just had a couple of things I 20 was going to send to you about training because Ms. Bernoudy and 21 I did a couple of webinars and there was one thing on the list. You had the bees. You had two webinars with the same title on 22 23 there. That was all okay. 2.4 I'll double check those. MR. PAISON: Okay. 25 THE DEPARTMENT: And if you got additional ones we

```
don't have on there just e-mail them to me and I'll add them.
 1
 2
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah; yeah; yeah.
                               Yup. We'll add them.
 3
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                                                      And I know
    Commissioner Willis did send us one that we added to the list
 5
    that he took you.
 6
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I think I missed something.
              THE DEPARTMENT: I believe you sent us an e-mail with
    a training that you had taken when we asked about trainings, so
 8
    we added that to the list.
 9
10
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                    Yeah.
11
              THE DEPARTMENT: If anyone else has any trainings that
12
    aren't on that list that's in the report that they think should
13
    be added, just e-mail it to me, and I'll add it to the list.
14
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yep. Absolutely. And if there's
15
    training the Commission is interested in having or types of
16
    training you're interested that we can research for you to see
    what's available, that's something that, you know, we can assist
17
18
    with as well.
19
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin?
20
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                    Oh, no. I'm sorry.
21
    reading the list that -- I'm done.
22
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: All right. Commissioner Willis.
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I don't know if we can impact
23
2.4
    this at all because I don't think it has a physical location in
    Southfield, but Comcast and the way e-mail is delivered as a
25
```

utility into the City is really strange. Comcast has a
monopoly. AT&T shares a little bit. And I don't know if we
could look at a way to -- I don't know -- find a way to ensure
that we can zone it so that it works best for tomorrow. They
seem to just have a profit center. Again, I don't have a method
for it, but I hate Comcast.

CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Griffis.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Well, I think going back ten years or so, I've said the word mixed use, and what does that mean? Well, it's good that we're continuing to evolve in this mixed use corridor districts, and at least it's the open-mindedness to these are the kind of buildings we have in They're small buildings, and the market is kind of dictating, like, if there's an office user that wants to come into your four unit strip center, why is that not allowed? You know, like, at least the open-mindedness is going the right direction. And how can we start to implement these little updates of 1960s buildings and, you know, the new buildings are, I want to say, easy in a way because you're starting from scratch, but then there's always this financing piece of how do you get a building built? Well, no one trusts a speculative retail development, you know. So I did design a building in a different city, and they just said we want all business. You know, like, well, no one's going to fund that. So we were able to build, let's say, five townhouses hooked to a very small

1 office like flex space and they approved it. So that wasn't exactly the letter of the law, but, you know, like our 2 Commission has there's some like, oh yeah, that's what we were thinking, and I see how that works to this, you know, the particular buildings that we have in our city. So that's been positive. Even the, you know, giant office center with the sea of parking around it that now becomes a self storage. that's not exciting, but what's exciting is the sea of parking 8 9 gets redeveloped as the next buildings, and we've got a few of 10 those come through. So it's not the most glamorous version of what you think is mixed use, but it's our mixed use, and it's 11 starting to be implemented, which I think is a good thing. 12 13 think more of the same. The accessory dwelling units item is 14 really interesting to me, you know, and I think of that as more 15 dense urban places like your -- you know -- your downtown 16 Detroit carriage houses from back when there was alleys and your 17 college towns where there's all these things but, you know, what 18 can we do here on our bigger lots? Like we have plenty of 19 Why not have an accessory unit? I think that's great. 20 So that's exciting. 21 THE DEPARTMENT: We actually, I think within the last 22 couple of days, we got a proposal to do a duplex with a little 23 more -- a second two-story duplex as opposed to the habitat 24 version. And, you know, we have some of our older single family districts that have a lot of vacant lots. And if we can get 25

duplexes at least are not out of character, too much out of 1 scale, that increases density and it helps with affordability. 2 So that's another area we're going to take a closer look to see if our attached residential is the best fit for that or maybe we need to create a new district to allow possibly the two to four family, the missing middle housing in some of our, "single family districts." UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Yeah, a lot of communities 8 9 are experimenting with allowing those like within single family 10 districts by right. Like they're redefining single family 11 districts to be like anything up to two to three to four units, 12 if the lot can meet certain development standards because 13 massing if the structure fits into the neighborhood reasonably 14 well. MR. PAISON: And to add to that real quick, we have 15 16 had some interest in the mixed use corridor. We've had some 17 projects brought to us in the last couple months, so started to 18 get some traction. 19 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye. 20 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: I have a couple of things 21 I'd like to for you all to consider. A more proactive approach to the rezoning. For example, from the industrial to the 22 23 general business as opposed to waiting for petitioners to

approach us, maybe we could take a look at rezoning some of

those, especially like along Telegraph, some of those places

24

25

```
that we want to provide opportunities so that developers won't
 1
    have to have that step. That step has already been done. So
    that's something to think about. I would also like to -- I
    agree with Commissioner Griffis with the mixed use, the more we
    start to look at encouraging people to look at those properties
    in different ways, I think that that's a good thing and being a
    little bit more open to what that configuration would look like,
    because we may not have thought of everything, so just being a
 8
 9
    little bit more open to it. So those are the two things that
    I'd like to see us focus in on.
10
11
              Oh, and there's one other thing, the -- what is it?
12
    The -- which one is it -- the site plan reviews. Site plan
    reviews done at the Commission level.
13
14
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                              At the department level.
15
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Department level.
16
              THE DEPARTMENT: We are planning on taking that to
17
    Council sometime probably in the first quarter of 2024.
18
    also needed for us to retain our Redevelopment Ready
19
    Certification. And given the holidays, the election, and some
20
    backfilling of projects, we just need some time to bring it to
21
    Council, but that is our goal is hopefully the first quarter, no
    later than the second quarter of 2024. And that also would be a
22
23
    lively discussion when we have our joint meeting.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Has that joint meeting been
25
    scheduled?
```

```
1
              THE DEPARTMENT: Well, not yet, but we will plan on
 2
    doing it either late first quarter or early second quarter,
 3
    similar to what we did last year.
              MR. PAISON: Okay. And it might make sense to -- just
    because of the schedule, I was looking at the calendar, after
    you've had the hearings on the CIP would probably be a better
    time to try to fit another meeting in because up to that point
 8
    it's going to be a little busy.
 9
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah.
                                      And then May and June are --
    there's a number of extra meetings for budget adoptions, so we
10
11
    got to find the right time, but we plan on doing that annually
12
    now.
13
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE:
                                         Okay.
14
              THE DEPARTMENT:
                               Yeah.
15
              COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: All right.
16
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin.
17
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Has anything been done or said
18
    to look at some of these buildings that are vacant? I know the
19
    Ramada Inn, I was surprised to see that it was deteriorating.
20
    So converting those to residence, or the one on Northland Drive.
21
    I forget what the --
22
              THE DEPARTMENT: Well, as a matter of fact, Northland
23
    Drive, we are constantly discussing with multiple developers on
24
    multiple former hotels and office buildings about conversions,
    some of which are storage, which we're not that excited about,
25
```

1 residential, some mixed use. And some of these properties are under bankruptcy or have other structural code violations that hamper redevelopment. I was in discussions with the trustee of the bankruptcy court today on 1600 JL Hudson, the former Michigan Inn and plaza, for some redevelopment for some both temporary use and for long-term use. I had a developer contact me yesterday from Chicago inquiring about a nursing facility for seniors. So we have those phone calls all the time, but we 8 9 don't have site control in many cases. 10 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah. 11 THE DEPARTMENT: And two in particular, they're tied 12 up with either court or a trust in agency that is managing them 13 until they can find a viable option. And as you know, as these 14 buildings, the longer they stay vacant, the more problems and 15 issues they have, whether it's flooding, whether it's vandalism, 16 whether it's fire, whether it's --17 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Just deterioration in general 18 period. 19 THE DEPARTMENT: -- just general deterioration because 20 they're not boarded up properly. 21 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah. 22 THE DEPARTMENT: So we're constantly dealing with that 23 on a number of our vacant properties. The old Reynolds Aluminum 24 building headquarters was a Vic Tanny. They had a flood. that water is mold and mildew and damage and --25

1	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: And it spreads.
2	THE DEPARTMENT: it just creates a more difficult,
3	more expensive redevelopment.
4	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioners, are there any
5	other feedback for the Department? Okay. Given no, we're going
6	to move Tom, are we done with all your items here?
7	MR. PAISON: Yeah, that covers the annual report. And
8	I think we're going to come back with the final version after we
9	finalize this list for you to adopt next month to send on to
10	Council.
11	The next item up would be adoption of the next year's
12	calendar. If the which I sent in your packet for the 2024
13	calendar. If this calendar's acceptable, if we could adopt
14	that.
15	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Commissioners, please
16	take a look at the proposed calendar. Are there any questions?
17	Comment? Is there a motion?
18	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I have a question.
19	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Yes.
20	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: We have The Sip in February, on
21	February 21st. Did we do that we did that in one day before?
22	THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. Those typically start at 3
23	p.m.
24	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah; yeah.
25	THE DEPARTMENT: We try to get them done within two to

```
three hours, just given the amount of departments that have to
 1
    come, and so that's a meeting that we start earlier in the day.
    And then from there, we try to summarize. And I usually then do
    the presentation on behalf of all the departments and the
    departments that are on call if there's any questions.
    they'll have their presentation to you on the 21st. Then when
    you guys hold your public meetings and make recommendation, I do
    the presentation on behalf of the departments, and then it gets
 8
    forwarded to Council, and I reiterate that presentation.
 9
    it's usually at least three, three presentations before they
10
11
    adopt.
12
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                    That was the reason for the two
13
    regular meetings in March?
14
              THE DEPARTMENT:
15
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                   Yeah.
                                           Yeah.
                                                  Okay.
                                                         I --
16
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                   Is there a motion?
                                   Motion to approve the January
17
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
18
    24th through January 20 -- I'm sorry -- January 2004 (sic)
    through January 2005 (sic) calendars as presented.
19
20
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                    Support.
21
                                   It's been moved by Commissioner
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
22
    Martin and second by Commissioner Willis that we accept the
23
    planning commission meeting schedule January 2024 through
2.4
    January 2025. All in favor?
25
              (All in favor)
```

1 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Motion carries.

Next agenda on our agenda is the--

THE DEPARTMENT: Just -- I'm sorry.

CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Go ahead.

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

THE DEPARTMENT: Just noting the next set of meetings for scheduling, as we typically do, the next meeting will be the study meeting on January 10th, 2024. We do have items for that agenda, and so we will be bringing that back. We will have that I've already actually put notices out. I'll have to actually update the notice to add this one that was postponed to the regular meeting at the end of the month, but I think I still have time to do that because I got the notice in early. So I'll have to do that. But anyway, so definitely we'll have a meting on January 10th as an introduction for the new items that are coming forward. We have three items, and then definitely have a regular meeting on whichever those items progress. The middle study meeting, if we have some of these zoning update issues related to the B districts and the office use and the site plan review to bring back to you, that might -- the 17th meeting might be a good meeting to keep as a -- you know, not a long meeting, but come in, you know, to present the additional information that you requested that we put together is my plan for the 17th.

MR. PAISON: And then just to remind you, this gas station will come back on the 24th.

1	THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah.
2	MR. PAISON: But at the study meeting, we're going to
3	get together and review the information that was received
4	tonight and we'll give you like a brief update. I'd like to
5	have some maps prepared on as we have time to study what was
6	presented to us so that we can better articulate what the
7	requirements are and so forth.
8	CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Commissioner Martin.
9	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah. Don't we have an election
10	coming up sometime in January?
11	THE DEPARTMENT: January. It's usually the last is
12	it the last regular meeting?
13	MR. PAISON: I looked at the bylaws. It is the first
14	regular meeting of the year, so it'd be the 24th.
15	COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah. Okay.
16	MR. PAISON: And as the Chair current noted to your
17	term max, so she can't run for a Chair again. You could serve
18	as a Chair after you've been off a Chair, but like you can only
19	do two consecutive years in any position. Mr. Willis and Mr.
20	Griffis have only in their position currently for a year, so
21	they could go again for another year. Just for thinking about,
22	you know, there'll be some level of musical chairs because we
23	need a new Chair.
24	THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah. And, again, it's not hard and
25	fast, but our unofficial rule and I don't Mr. Griffis, if

he's so inclined, typically the Vice Chair then is considered 1 for the Chair, but that's up that's up to Mr. Griffis and everybody else. But that's the protocol that we've followed in the past. COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: I did volunteer for Vice Chair 5 at this time. THE DEPARTMENT: Well, it gives something to think about because on the 24th you need to vote on it. 8 9 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: I need to just sit with my own computer screen for my entirety of my chair previously. 10 11 MR. PAISON: I think you did a yeoman's job during 12 COVID, but as you pointed out you didn't have really the 13 opportunity to do live --14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: I think it was like three 15 meetings up in front of people. 16 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Real humans. 17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yes. 18 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there anything for the good 19 of the order? Given none -- Commissioner Martin. 20 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Just in passing, I think Mr. 21 Croad has an update on us on the dog park. 22 MR. CROAD: Yeah. And I actually I actually put that 23 on the focus for next year. 2.4 CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. 25 MR. CROAD: So we had an internal with all the

1 departments. I'm not going to speculate on the cost, but you would be surprised on all the costs. So Mr. Zoran had all the 2 departments in to see what value engineering, what things we could do as staff to help reduce the cost from going out to contract. And we're crunching some numbers to be able to even do a phase one. But as part of that plan, we, as on behalf of the planning commission, will hold at least a public input meeting from the neighborhood. At our meeting last week I 8 offered to Ms. Fields just tell us when you're ready for us to 9 10 hold the hold the town meeting, open house, whatever you want to 11 call it. So there is progress being made, but we all got 12 sticker shocked when we got the preliminary engineering costs, 13 and we're trying to figure out the best way to move forward and 14 still, you know, do a decent job. This will be a multiphase, 15 multiyear project, but the basics are enlarging the parking lot, 16 creating a small and a large dog park, even if it's 50% what's The issues are there's some drainage and we have to 17 18 take care of the drainage issues. They want to get electrical 19 and plumbing to have a small restroom, and then we want to expand the pathway, but because of all the threats with the 20 21 Jewish community the adjacent synagogue and school is concerned 22 about safety, so we're talking about lighting and we're looking 23 at using the lake bollards, if they make sense, then there's a 24 sensitivity on the sabbath. You can't activate any mechanical 25 stuff, so we can adjust that. And, you know, there's a whole

```
host of other things. Removing the berm, that's something maybe
 1
    that DPW can do just to try to identify additional funding
    sources to make sure it gets done. And that was basically what
    we talked about last week. And we'll keep you posted on the
   progress.
 6
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS: If you have a town hall style
   meeting, do you anticipate having it here or at the -- in the
   neighborhood?
 8
 9
              THE DEPARTMENT: Yeah, I forget exactly which of your
    neighborhood groups, but when I presented before, you either had
10
11
    a school or clubhouse that's available, so we would try to bring
12
    the meeting to the neighborhood to make it -- to encourage more
13
    participation.
14
              COMMISSIONER WILLIS:
                                    Okav.
15
              THE DEPARTMENT: And maybe you guys can help with that
16
    at that?
              Okay.
17
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN: Commissioner Martin, do you have
18
    anything else?
19
                                         I'm done.
              COMMISSIONER MARTIN:
                                    No.
20
              CHAIR STEPHENS-GUNN:
                                   Anything for the good of the
21
    order?
           Going once, going twice. Meeting is adjourned at 8:26
22
   p.m.
23
              (Recording concluded at 8:26 p.m.)
2.4
25
```

1	CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER	
2		
3		
4	I, SHEILA H. RAYMOND, do hereby certify that I was	
5	authorized to transcribe the foregoing recorded proceeding; and	
6	that the transcript is a true and accurate transcription, to the	
7	best of my ability, taken while listening to the provide	
8	recording.	
9		
10	I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not of counsel or attorney	
11	for either or any of the parties to said proceedings, nor in any	
12	way interested in the events of this cause, and that I am not	
13	related to any of the parties thereto.	
14		
15		
16	Dated this 2nd day of JANUARY, 2024	
17		
18	Sheila H Raymond	
19	· i book i t t i t	
20	SHEILA H. RAYMOND	
21	;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;;	
22		
23	andra Herafulu	
24	The 1 01.24.2	<i>9</i>) .
25	Robert Willis, Secretary Date Andrea Gruber	Level