

CITY OF SOUTHFIELD PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

DATE TAKEN: JANUARY 24, 2024

TIME: 6:30 p.m. - 8:31 p.m.

(Based on Time Zone from Notice)

TRANSCRIBED BY: SHEILA H. RAYMOND

1 APPEARANCES

2

3 COUNCIL MEMBERS:

4 DR. GERALYN STEPHENS-GUNN, EDE, Chair

5 JEREMY GRIFFIS, Chair

6 ROBERT WILLIS, Vice Chair

7 ANDREA STORCH GRUBER, Secretary

8 CYNTHIA BERNOUDY

9 ANTHONY MARTIN

10 GHANA ADELL GOODWIN-DYE

11

12 TERRY CROAD, Director of Planning

13 THOMAS PAISON, Deputy City Planner

14 MICHAEL BOLLIN, Planner

15

16

17

(OTHERS AS MAY APPEAR IN THE TRANSCRIPT)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

INDEX OF PROCEEDINGS

PAGE

Proceedings	4
Certificate of Transcriptionist	90

P R O C E E D I N G S

1  
2 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Good evening, everyone. I'd like  
3 to welcome you to the City of Southfield regular meeting of the  
4 Planning Commission for January 24th, 2024. Let us please stand  
5 for the pledge of allegiance.

6 (Pledge of Allegiance recited by all.)

7 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: May I have a roll call, please?

8 MR. BOLLIN: Yes, ma'am. Ms. Bernoudy?

9 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Present.

10 MR. BOLLIN: Ms. Goodwin-Dye?

11 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Present.

12 MR. BOLLIN: Mr. Griffis?

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Here.

14 MR. BOLLIN: Ms. Gruber?

15 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Here.

16 MR. BOLLIN: Mr. Martin?

17 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Here.

18 MR. BOLLIN: Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

19 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Here.

20 MR. BOLLIN: Madam Chair. You do have a quorum to  
21 conduct business.

22 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Oh, I'm sure everyone has had an  
23 opportunity to review our agenda for this evening. Is there a  
24 motion to approve our agenda?

25 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Madam Chair, I'd like the agenda

1 to be corrected to follow the Bylaws Section 4, order of  
2 business for an annual meeting, after announcements and  
3 communications.

4 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: One moment.

5 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: It's Page 4 of the Bylaws.

6 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: In Section 4 of the Bylaws, it  
7 says, The order of business for the annual meeting to be the  
8 commission's first regular meeting in January shall be as  
9 follows: Number 1, call the order. Number 2, Pledge of  
10 Allegiance. Number 3, the roll call. Number 4, announcements  
11 and communications. Number 5, election of officers. Number 6,  
12 taking of the chair by the new -- by the new chair. Public  
13 hearings is 7. Eight is approval of meeting. Nine is adoption  
14 of the calendar. Ten is miscellaneous. Eleven is adjournment.

15 Everyone have an opportunity to review that?

16 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Yes.

17 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a motion to modify our  
18 agenda according to Section 4 of our Bylaws?

19 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Madam Chair, I'd like to make a  
20 Motion to Amend our agenda to conform with the Bylaws.

21 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a second?

22 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: I support.

23 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner  
24 Martin and second by Commissioner Goodwin-Dye that we modify our  
25 agenda to move the item under miscellaneous, which is the third

1 bullet on miscellaneous election of officers to after  
2 announcements and communications on tonight's agenda.

3 All in favor?

4 (All in favor.)

5 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Oppose? The motion carries.

6 Next we have announcements. Oh, did we approve the  
7 agenda? No, we haven't. Is there motion to approve the agenda  
8 with the modification that we just specified?

9 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: So moved.

10 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Is there a second?

11 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Second.

12 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: It's been moved by Commissioner  
13 Martin and second by Commissioner Goodwin-Dye -- what --

14 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Twice.

15 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: -- that we approve the agenda with  
16 the modifications. All in favor?

17 (All in favor.)

18 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Motion carries.

19 Now, we move on to announcements and communications.  
20 Are there announcements and communications?

21 MR. PAISON: No, ma'am.

22 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Given such, it looks like  
23 it's -- now it's time for our elections. Given that my term as  
24 chair expires at this moment, so is there a nomination for chair  
25 of the Planning Commission? Commissioner Willis?

1 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I move for Jeremy Griffis to be  
2 chair of planning.

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Accept.

4 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Accept. Are there any other  
5 nominations for chair of the planning commission moving forward?

6 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No.

7 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Given none, all in favor -- how we  
8 --

9 DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah, you can take the vote now.

10 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: All in favor of Commissioner  
11 Jeremy Griffis as chair of the Planning Commission? All in  
12 favor?

13 (All in favor.)

14 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: All right. Motion carries.  
15 Congratulations. And would you like to conduct the rest of the  
16 election?

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. Sure.

18 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: All right.

19 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Surprise. You get to -- you get  
20 to move over.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. I was not aware  
22 that this was happening today, but here we are. So we're now  
23 looking for a nomination for vice chair. I'm going to nominate  
24 Robert Willis as the vice chair.

25 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I would accept.

1 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Any other nominations  
2 for vice chair?

3 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No.

4 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Seeing none, all in favor of  
5 accepting Robert Willis as vice chair, say aye?

6 (All in favor.)

7 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any opposed? No. You get to  
8 -- you got to --

9 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: No, wait until we're through.

10 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: You're going to stay there?  
11 Okay. Looking for a nomination for secretary.

12 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: I'd like to nominate Commissioner  
13 Gruber for secretary of the Planning commission?

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Do you accept?

15 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Commissioner Gruber has  
17 accepted the nomination. Any other nominations for secretary?  
18 Seeing none, so all in favor of Commissioner Gruber being  
19 elected to the position of secretary, say aye?

20 (All in favor.)

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any opposed? None. All right.  
22 Congratulations.

23 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Thank you.

24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Is that everybody?

25 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: That's everybody.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. So now back to the regularly scheduled meeting, I believe. The first item 24725 Greenfield Road.

MR. PAISON: Yes, Mr. Chair.

This is the request to convert an existing general office building to medical office use at 24725 Greenfield, it's Greenfield and George Washington Drive. It is a -- the change of use creates a parking deficiency and they are renovating the building as well, so that creates a need for a site plan because they did have to reconfigure the parking somewhat. I do note that with the current configuration we're going to talk about, there are six basically short would also acquire approval by the Zoning Board Of Appeals for a waiver. This is the existing site. As you can see, there's angle parking along the back of the building, and then there was angled parking along the north side of the building with narrow drive aisles and turning radiuses. Some street views of the site. You've got the George Washington view on the top and then the view from Greenfield on the bottom with that barricade. And then you have the view at the top. There's the north side of the building, which is going to be converted to parallel parking to provide a little more drive aisle on the north side. And then the angle parking on the back of the building, which would be flipping along the rear where they're adding the screening wall and removing that row of

1 landscaping. The current zoning is OS, office service, which  
2 does allow the medical office use and the general office use  
3 both. It is in a local mixed use future land use area, which is  
4 consistent with the office service uses. The revised site plan,  
5 you've got a 90 degree parking going to be going down the west  
6 side of the property up against the screen wall separating it  
7 from the residence on the other side with a one-way drive aisle.  
8 And then around the north side of the building, there'll be two  
9 parallel parking spaces and a drive aisle wide enough then to  
10 accommodate proper maneuvering around that corner and out of the  
11 site, which was asked for by the fire marshal. The floor plan,  
12 they'll be converting the whole building into medical offices.  
13 There is a -- the central area is going to remain a foyer with  
14 the restrooms and then a stairwell down to a storage basement.  
15 So there's about, it's not quite a third of the building, but  
16 it's more than a quarter, probably about 30 percent of the  
17 building is this kind of central corridor that is not exam room  
18 or waiting room or office space itself. We do have the  
19 petitioner present today to answer any questions and let me see  
20 if he's here, Mr. Goldberg.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Please start with your stating  
22 your name and address for the record, and then tell us a little  
23 bit about your project and the recent changes.

24 MR. GOLDBERG: Moshe Goldberg, 15618 George  
25 Washington, Southfield, Michigan. First, congratulations on

1 everyone's new position. Thank you for the constant taking care  
2 of the City. The architect just called in sick, so I came  
3 running in. What is it that you -- I know he was here two weeks  
4 ago.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yeah. I guess, just remind us  
6 about the project. What --

7 MR. GOLDBERG: So the project is --

8 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: What your goals are.

9 MR. GOLDBERG: -- that this building was for 30 years  
10 a CPA's office, and people in the neighborhood, when it went up  
11 for sale, we decided -- people thought it was a good idea to get  
12 it and make it into a doctor's office. We explored last year to  
13 do that, and there was a parking shortage, and we worked with  
14 Planning to accommodate the upgrading and making it work. So  
15 that's what the community wants, so we're trying to put  
16 together.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. Open up to the  
18 commission for any comments or questions. Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

19 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: When your architect was here two  
20 weeks ago, I requested that he provide us with support that the  
21 neighbor who is right next door has been made aware and is  
22 comfortable moving forward. Are you able to share that  
23 information?

24 MR. GOLDBERG: I actually emailed with him, and he had  
25 it printed out. I just emailed it to the planner and to

1 Mr. Paison, as well as he came last year in person and spoke in  
2 support of the project. I can read it off if you want from my  
3 email.

4 MR. PAISON: It's a very short letter. I've got it in  
5 my email here. "January 23rd, 2024, to whom it concern, I, Wyam  
6 Levin, the owner of 15540 George Washington Drive, bordering  
7 2475 Greenfield, approves of a masonry wall or preferably other  
8 fencing per ordinance and per plan."

9 So he's fine with a screening approach in that area  
10 with a all or fence.

11 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Martin?

13 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: No, no questions.

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Willis?

15 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Probably more a statement than  
16 question.

17 First of all, I appreciate your tenacity. You've been  
18 here before us a couple of times, and again, I think that effort  
19 should be rewarded, but -- and I also appreciate the way you  
20 redid the parking. I think that was such a major issue for you  
21 and for you to come up with a solution, kudos to you.

22 MR. GOLDBERG: Thank you.

23 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: The last, I think I'm going to  
24 have a concern with it no matter because the rear door opens to  
25 the sidewalk without a space. I'm always going to have a

1 concern with safety. I hope -- my hope is that you would have  
2 a, you know, I have no idea how to fix that, but I'm going to --  
3 I'm going to have that concern about safety if anything happens  
4 to the other doors and you had to leave.

5 MR. GOLDBERG: I'm not sure I fully understand, but I  
6 --

7 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Well, just the fact that it  
8 opens on the sidewalk, the door that --

9 MR. GOLDBERG: The front? The one on Greenfield?

10 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: On Greenfield? Yes.

11 MR. GOLDBERG: That's not the -- that's like an extra,  
12 or emergency exit. Typically, everyone uses the door by the  
13 parking lot.

14 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. Okay. I hear you. Thank  
15 you.

16 MR. GOLDBERG: Thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Bernoudy, any  
18 comments?

19 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: No questions at this time.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner -- sorry. I was  
21 like, I moved one seat over and I lost -- everything is like  
22 scrambled.

23 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: I have nothing at this time.

24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Gruber?

25 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: No, nothing. Best of luck.

1 MR. GOLDBERG: Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Yeah. You've made a  
3 dramatic improvement to a very tight parking lot. I think it's  
4 the best you -- you know, it seems like the best you can do. So  
5 it's much improved. And, yeah, it's a nice building, so glad  
6 you're able to save it and hopefully use it.

7 Does the Planning Department have any comments or the  
8 recommendation and/or?

9 MR. PAISON: Yes, for sure. We do have a  
10 recommendation. The Planning Department is recommending  
11 favorable recommendation of the site plan review requested of  
12 Moshe Goldberg to convert the existing building at 24725 from  
13 general office to medical office use. It does -- all the  
14 development features, I'm going to summarize, minimize the  
15 possibility of adverse effects on adjacent properties. It does  
16 have adequate access for major or secondary thoroughfares in  
17 streets. And this recommendation is based on the documents,  
18 facts and representations and stipulations submitted by the  
19 applicant placed on the record.

20 There are a couple of recommended conditions.  
21 Obviously, getting the required parking variance from the Zoning  
22 Board of Appeals. Consistent with these, the plans submitted by  
23 Zack M. Ostroff and Associates dated January 8, 2024. Perpetual  
24 maintenance agreement for the landscape and other areas to be  
25 entered into to implement recommendations of the Southfield

1 Police Crime Prevention Bureau, and continuous compliance with  
2 all applicable ordinances, codes and laws. Work to be done  
3 under permits issued and final inspections by the City. And the  
4 medical office need to be Monday through Friday, 8 a.m. to 5  
5 p.m., as was previously discussed, if those are still  
6 acceptable?

7 MR. GOLDBERG: Standard office hours, right.

8 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. I'm looking for a motion  
9 from the Planning Commission?

10 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Mr. Chair?

11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yes, Mr. Martin.

12 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Motion to approve PSP23-0003.

13 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Support.

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We've got a favorable  
15 recommendation from by Commissioner Martin, supported by  
16 Commissioner Willis. All in favor proposed?

17 (All in favor.)

18 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Opposed? All right.

19 MR. GOLDBERG: Thank you very much.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. Congratulations.

21 MR. GOLDBERG: It's been a pleasure.

22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Moving on to Item E, the 24848  
23 Southfield Road.

24 MR. PAISON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This is an item  
25 that's coming back to you. The public hearing was held on

1 December 13, 2023, where some information was presented that the  
2 Planning Department wanted some additional time to review, came  
3 in very -- like right before the meeting. The public hearing  
4 was, as I said, was held. There is not -- another public  
5 hearing was not noticed as it is not required. So this is  
6 really just to update the Commission since the public hearing  
7 was held and then for the Planning Commission to make a  
8 recommendation to go to council. I'll kind of recap here.

9 I wanted to go over just generally a summary. We're  
10 adding this to all these requests, a summary of the different  
11 types of state liquor licenses. There are off-premise licenses,  
12 which are sealed containers that are sold for consumption  
13 elsewhere. The SDM, which is for the specialty -- specially  
14 designated merchant's license, which is for sale of beer and  
15 wine. And then the SDD, specially designated distributor  
16 license which is for liquor or spirits. These are state liquor  
17 sales licenses. There are no -- under the state regulations,  
18 there are no limits on the number of the off-premise types of  
19 licenses and no separation requirements. There are also no  
20 separation requirements or limits written into our ordinance for  
21 those activities, other than our special land use being required  
22 for gas stations, but there are no spacing limits or absolute  
23 number limits.

24 There are also what they call on-premise retailer  
25 license types, and this is sometimes where people get confused.



1 This is where alcoholic beverages can be served for consumption  
2 on the premises, therefore it's called on premise. And you got  
3 your hotel licenses. Your tavern, your Class C, which is your  
4 standard bar restaurant. Your G1 and G2, which are golf club,  
5 you know, golf clubs, private corporate golf clubs. Your brew  
6 pubs. And then clubs, nonprofit organizations, your, you know,  
7 Veterans of Foreign War and that sort of -- the Elks, that sort  
8 of thing.

9           So just kind of an overview, there are a couple of  
10 other ones that are just kind of rare. So these are the most  
11 common types of state issued liquor licenses. We did map  
12 additionally all of the currently -- I pulled the list from the  
13 State like two weeks ago, and we made a map. The blue triangles  
14 are all the beer wine sales, the SDM state licenses. And the  
15 green circles are the actual SDD licenses for the sale of  
16 spirits. So you can see they're kind of distributed around the  
17 city. There's a concentration of them up 12 Mile in like  
18 Franklin area, but, you know, they're a lot of intersections  
19 you'll see multiple sellers of alcoholic beverages. Pretty  
20 standard. I assume if we did this to almost any city, we'd get  
21 a similar distribution.

22           Then we did add some additional information to this  
23 slide, which we had last time, which it shows the blue oval  
24 being the proposed site. The orange is another gas station that  
25 doesn't currently have alcohol sales. The red is the existing

1 New Abbey Wine and Liquor Store to the north. The CVS  
2 kiddy-corner sells beer and wine and liquor as well. The Dollar  
3 General, which is across and on the south side of 10 mile, sells  
4 beer and wine is closed at the moment. I think there was a fire  
5 in the adjacent space, but it still holds a license. So just to  
6 give you an idea what's going on in that immediate thousands --  
7 that circles 1,000 foot radius around that intersection. Here's  
8 the actual site again, existing gas station with its canopy and  
9 it's access from the Southfield and 10 mile. Existing  
10 conditions, there are actually some street views back when the  
11 weather was nicer and you could see things a little better. The  
12 zoning currently, it's a 30-foot strip of P zoning along  
13 Southfield and B3 for the bulk of the site where the actual  
14 building is. It's local mixed use, future land use, which is  
15 consistent with the B3. There is a nice color rendering of the  
16 site landscape plan, just to give a better idea. They are  
17 proposing to add bike racks. A connection to the sidewalk and  
18 freshen up the landscaping as part of this project. The floor  
19 plan, the yellow highlights where the reconfigured storage will  
20 be in the site inside the building. You got the cold bottled  
21 beer and wine cooler and liquor shelves behind the cashier.

22 Elevations, these are the existing elevations of the  
23 building. The outside is not really proposed to change. Some  
24 photos of the interior that were provided by the petitioner.  
25 You got the beer coolers, beer cave, wine rack, liquor shelves

1 by where those would be located. And I believe the petitioner  
2 is present if they'd like to come forward.

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Please state your name and  
4 address for the record and tell us a little bit more about your  
5 project.

6 MR. YALDO: Sure. I'm Mark Yaldo, 24848 Southfield.  
7 I got a project. I live in Southfield for 32 years, and I  
8 invest in Southfield over here in the corner on 10 Mile and  
9 Southfield. For the gas station, this is about a 17 years. And  
10 this business has been changing so much. And we can -- in the  
11 state they changed their rule, you know, on a liquor license as  
12 far as the gas station and the beer and wine and everything, you  
13 know. So, and the city they change their ordinance, and we  
14 apply for that, which is obviously -- it's -- we all need the  
15 business because this business is changing so much, you know,  
16 right now, because business is different. And we all, we need  
17 to keep our doors open, you know, to maintain the expensive  
18 taxes, the property, everything else. So, you know, we want to  
19 keep our doors open. You know, we want to stay in the business  
20 in Southfield. You know, again, and whatever, you know, we've  
21 been doing, meeting the requirement for the State. We meet the  
22 requirement for the city, and --

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Thank you. How many  
24 other comments?

25 MR. PAISON: Just answer questions.

1           COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Just a reminder to the public,  
2 we held the public hearing on this last month, so if there are  
3 any public comments, there's a public comment section towards  
4 the end of the meeting that we can -- we've got a few people  
5 signed in on the sign-in sheet.

6           All right. Open up to the commission for any  
7 comments. Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

8           DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: At this time, I have no concerns.

9           MR. YALDO: Thanks.

10          COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Martin?

11          COMMISSIONER MARTIN: No concerns.

12          COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Willis?

13          COMMISSIONER WILLIS: No questions.

14          COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Gruber?

15          COMMISSIONER GRUBER: No questions.

16          COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye?

17          COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No questions.

18          COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: And Commissioner Bernoudy?

19          COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Thank you.

20          Have you received any pushback from your neighbors,  
21 your next door neighbors, the business owners?

22          MR. YALDO: No, not at this time.

23          COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Thank you. And when do you  
24 plan to open, you know, the liquor?

25          MR. YALDO: Well, we are working with the license

1 right now. We are purchasing license, you know, from another  
2 location, and that's to be a transfer, you know. The State has  
3 already approved. We just waiting for the City. And, you know,  
4 after that, you know, we could move forward to get it.

5 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: I see.

6 MR. PAISON: Immediately after the approval goes from  
7 the City.

8 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Okay.

9 DIRECTOR CROAD: If I could through the chair, just  
10 you guys are recommending. They'll have to go through a public  
11 hearing and approval at the City Council level. Then they can  
12 come in and apply for their license if they get approved. So  
13 they got to get their local zoning in place first before they  
14 can request the license.

15 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Well, I think the site plan  
18 show it's a tight site, but it does appear to meet the zoning  
19 ordinance and all the different conditions from what I've seen.  
20 And it's not much more clearly explained how small of a  
21 percentage of the store it looks like the alcohol sales really  
22 becomes. It's just complementary. I don't think you're going  
23 to draw a new world of people coming down Southfield Road.

24 MR. YALDO: It's only convenient.

25 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: You're not Target or Walmart

1 all of a sudden, so I think it's a -- all right.

2 Planning Department, do you have a recommendation?

3 MR. PAISON: Yes, Mr. Chairman. With regard to the  
4 special land -- special use, the Planning Department recommends  
5 favorable recommendation of the special use request of Mark  
6 Yaldo 10 Southfield Sunoco to permit addition of liquor sales to  
7 the existing gas station/convenience store, 24848 Southfield  
8 Road.

9 The conditions are of the standards, proposed use will  
10 be of such size and character it will be in harmony with the  
11 appropriate orderly development of the general business  
12 district. The B3 location, size and intensity and periods of  
13 operation are designed to eliminate any possible nuisance likely  
14 to emanate therefrom, since this is all interior sales and its  
15 packages for consumption elsewhere. Proposed use is in accord  
16 with the spirit and purpose of the Chapter and is not  
17 inconsistent with or contrary to the objectives sought by the  
18 Chapter or principles of sound planning. Proposed uses of such  
19 character and the vehicular traffic generated will not be --  
20 have an adverse effect or be detrimental to the surrounding land  
21 uses or the adjacent thoroughfares. Proposed uses of character,  
22 intensity and range on the site to eliminate any adverse effects  
23 for noise, dust, dirt, glare, odors, fumes. Proposed use will  
24 not be adverse for the promotion of health, safety, wealth for  
25 the community. Propose used is designed and operated so as to

1 provide security and safety to employees and general public.

2 And it is based on the documents, facts and representation

3 stipulations in the application and not placed on the record.

4 There are two conditions. One is approval of the site

5 plan by the City Council, and the second is continuous

6 compliance with all applicable codes and ordinances. Work to be

7 done under permits -- plans, permits and final inspections by

8 the City of Southfield.

9 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. So to the

10 Commission looking for a recommendation on just the special use

11 portion of this project at this time.

12 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Through the chair, I move for

13 favorable consideration of PSLU23-001317.

14 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: I second it.

15 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We have a favorable

16 recommendation by Commissioner Willis and second by Commissioner

17 Bernoudy.

18 All in favor?

19 (All in favor.)

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any opposed? None.

21 All right. So now the second portion of this project,

22 the site plan review. Any additional comments from the

23 Commission?

24 Seeing none, any additional comments from the Planning

25 Department?

1 MR. PAISON: We do have a recommendation, Mr.  
2 Chairman.

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Go ahead.

4 MR. PAISON: We do recommend favorable recommendation  
5 of the site plan review for 24848 Southfield Road for the  
6 addition of liquor sales to an existing gas station convenience  
7 store. The conditions that are for site plan review soon to be  
8 met. All developed features located minimize possible of  
9 adverse impacts to adjacent properties, and as to relate  
10 properly to pedestrian and vehicular traffic safety, basically  
11 unchanged or improved.

12 The site plan does show that access is provided only  
13 to a major or secondary thoroughfare or freeway service drive,  
14 and a proper relationship exists between the major and secondary  
15 thoroughfare and the driveways. And we also base this on the  
16 documents, facts, representations, stipulations submitted at the  
17 application and put on the public hearing record by the  
18 petitioner.

19 There are a few conditions subject to the condition of  
20 -- the conditions of PSLU23-0017 approved by City Council. Site  
21 and building to be developed per the submitted plans by Bearing  
22 Construction and Consulting November 13th, 2023. FPA for  
23 landscape plans, October 10, 2023. And the lighting plans for  
24 Bearing Construction and Consulting LLC dated October 27, 2023.  
25 The petitioner to implement the recommendations of Southfield



1 Police Department Crime Prevention Bureau regarding site  
2 security, and continuous compliance with all applicable  
3 ordinances, codes, laws, and statutes. Petitioner must perform  
4 all work under plans, permits and inspections approved by the  
5 City of Southfield.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. All right. Now,  
7 we're looking for a recommendation on the site plan, which is  
8 PSP23-0017.

9 COMMISSIONER STEPHENS-GUNN: I recommend the  
10 commission to accept a favorable recommendation for PSP23-0017,  
11 the site plan review.

12 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Second.

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. We've got a favorable  
14 recommendation by Dr. Stephens-Gunn and seconded by Commissioner  
15 Martin. All in favor?

16 (All in favor.)

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any oppose? None.

18 MR. YALDO: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Congratulations. Thank you.  
20 Next item, 24450 Telegraph Road.

21 MR. PAISON: All right. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

22 This is a special land use request to convert an existing  
23 industrial building, renovate, partially demolish and convert to  
24 use for used vehicle sales and an accessory servicing of  
25 vehicles for -- as part of that vehicle sales operation. Hours

1 of operation to be Monday through Saturday, 9 a.m. to 6 p.m.  
2 Number of employees, six. Number of cars for sale, 12. Here it  
3 is on Telegraph Road. A close up of the site. You can see  
4 the -- kind of that the building looks like it was added on to  
5 multiple times. The whole northern portion of that building  
6 with that kind of U-shape with the attachment, that's all being  
7 demolished.

8           And then that southern building is the one that's  
9 actually staying. Here's some photos of the existing exterior  
10 of the building, green siding, pitched roofs. Interesting  
11 architecture. The zoning is industrial I1. The future land use  
12 is Southfield Technology Corridor. The Southfield Technology  
13 Corridor does allow sort of a mix of activities including  
14 obviously R and D and industrial. And used vehicle sales is a  
15 special land use in the I1 District. This is the existing  
16 conditions demo plan. So you can see that like hatched sort of  
17 U-shaped building that's attached to the north. It's all  
18 hatched out, that's what's getting demolished, whereas the one  
19 that's outlined is the one that's staying. We included this  
20 because there was some lack of clarity the last time about what  
21 part was being demolished, so I included the demo plan and hoped  
22 that would clarify the issue.

23           This is the site landscape plan. So the building that  
24 will stay, there will be parking on the north and south side to  
25 stay open. You've got landscaping being added all along

1 Telegraph. And then they do have snow storage areas there in  
2 the red, color coded. They're adding bike racks and a sidewalk  
3 connection. So it is something of an improvement as far as that  
4 goes. There's a dumpster closure in the back corner, and that's  
5 next to the loading area.

6 This is the building floor plan, fairly simple. We've  
7 got overhead doors on the north and south side, a sales area, a  
8 paint booth, and a lift for servicing the vehicles. So this is  
9 where they'll be, you know, having their office space and  
10 working on the cars indoors. This is a revised elevation. They  
11 actually kind of took the nice rendering they gave us and made  
12 the actual elevation drawings consistent with it. So what you  
13 see at the top is the renderings both from the north -- it would  
14 be the northwest corner and the southeast corner -- or southwest  
15 corner. And then the actual elevation showing the changes.  
16 It's quite a transformation of the exterior of the building.  
17 It's going to look quite a bit different. Got some awnings on  
18 there and some different materials, some color on that, along  
19 with the landscaping. It's showing a little bit better in these  
20 top renderings than it was in the prior one. This is a close up  
21 of the rendering we saw last time, which is now consistent. And  
22 I believe the petitioner is present, if he can come forward.

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Please state your name and  
24 address for the record.

25 MR. SEMMA: Good evening, ladies and gentleman. My

1 name is Mike Semma, and I'm the consultant for this project.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Just your address for the  
3 record.

4 MR. SEMMA: 293 Burgundy Street, West Bloomfield,  
5 Michigan 48323.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Thanks. And anything to  
7 add above the presentation?

8 MR. SEMMA: Well, we are changing the use over here  
9 from industrial to auto sale, and also repair for all the  
10 client, not for the customer outside. There will be no sign to  
11 be on this place. We are demolishing this almost half of the  
12 building, and we're going to put a brand new building. It's  
13 going to be completely different from what it is right now.  
14 I'll show you some pictures of the old one and then the new,  
15 what it going to look like. So we're going to be improvement,  
16 more tax to the City, and better location. Is going to look  
17 like when you drive out on Telegraph.

18 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. Thank you.

19 Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

20 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: I just think that this is a  
21 beautiful rendition of what it is you all are going to do with  
22 that property. I think that I'm looking -- actually, I'm  
23 looking forward to seeing it. So good job on it. Thank you.

24 MR. SEMMA: Thank you very much.

25 MR. PAISON: Through the Chair. This does require a

1 public hearing. Typically, we open the public hearing prior to  
2 taking --

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yes.

4 MR. PAISON: -- to get any additional feedback you may  
5 want to discuss.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you for the reminder.

7 Okay. This is a public hearing. At this time I'd  
8 like to open the public hearing. If anyone would like to speak  
9 on this item, please approach the front. You'll have three  
10 minutes to speak.

11 MR. PAISON: Please have a seat MR. SEMMA.

12 MR. SEMMA: Yes.

13 MR. PAISON: Please sit down please.

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yeah. You can just sit over to  
15 the side in case the public wants to speak for a minute.

16 MR. SEMMA: Okay. So like I said --

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: -- so we're opening the public  
18 hearing at this time. If you could just step to the side.

19 MR. SEMMA: Yes.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We'll see if any public wants  
21 to come up. Seeing no public approach, we'll close the public  
22 hearing. All right. Now back to the Commission.

23 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: I've shared my comments.

24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. Commissioner  
25 Martin?

1 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Oh, I'm sorry. The snow area,  
2 there's a snow storage area, could you point that out?

3 MR. PAISON: Yeah. The two red areas on the north and  
4 south side of the building and then up in the top right corner  
5 by the dumpster, there's another spot for snow removal. It's a  
6 limited area.

7 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah.

8 MR. PAISON: It is a very awkwardly shaped site.

9 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Yeah, the rendition and the --  
10 okay. No further questions.

11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Willis?

12 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Thank you. Not a question, but  
13 again, a compliment for what this building was and what this  
14 rendition looks like. It is a world of difference, and so I  
15 think this is a major upgrade. Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Gruber?

17 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: No comments.

18 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye?

19 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No comments.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Bernoudy?

21 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Not comment as well, but I'd  
22 like to thank you for this rendition and the pictures. They're  
23 very nice. Thank you.

24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yeah. This is a very tough  
25 shaped site. I appreciate what you've done. And you do the

1 addition by subtraction. You take away a bunch of bad and come  
2 back with something good. So I think it's -- it's going to be a  
3 big improvement. Again, it's nice when kind of an odd-shaped  
4 building fits a perfect -- you know, fits the new user and  
5 you're able to meet all the ordinances and make all these  
6 improvements. And it looks like it's going to be really nice, a  
7 really different looking building. I can't wait to see that.  
8 Appreciate all the additional renderings, too. It's very  
9 helpful to -- okay.

10 Commissioner Willis?

11 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Just curious, when do you think  
12 construction will start and when do you think it would be  
13 completed?

14 MR. SEMMA: Construction will start after we pull the  
15 permits and we can call the inspection. And then it will be as  
16 soon as possible. As soon as we get approval from the City then  
17 we will move ahead and start working on it.

18 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Thank you.

19 MR. SEMMA: We are more than ready to do this.  
20 Tomorrow morning.

21 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Thank you.

22 MR. SEMMA: You're welcome.

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Planning Department, do you  
24 have a recommendation?

25 DIRECTOR CROAD: Before we could, if I could ask

1 through the chair, Mr. Paison, could we go back to slide 30?  
2 It's the second slide on this case, so it's after the special  
3 use introduction. Keep going. Yeah. That next slide.

4 MR. PAISON: This one?

5 DIRECTOR CROAD: This one, yeah. It says 30 on mine.  
6 Sorry. Is that indicating two separate lots or is it -- I'm a  
7 little confused by that, the blue line that is going down the  
8 middle of the property. Oh, that's the section line.

9 MR. PAISON: I'm just trying to get it to not  
10 highlight.

11 DIRECTOR CROAD: Okay. I just -- because I would make  
12 a recommendation that they consolidate the lots.

13 MR. PAISON: It's one parcel. It's a section line.  
14 It's a GISR plot.

15 DIRECTOR CROAD: It was a little confusing, so I just  
16 wanted to be clear.

17 MR. PAISON: We'll see if we can figure out a way to  
18 fix that first.

19 DIRECTOR CROAD: Okay. Thank you.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. Back to the  
21 Planning Department. Do you have a recommendation?

22 MR. PAISON: Planning Department recommends favorable  
23 recommendation of the special land use -- special use for Mike  
24 Semma, Atlas Consulting for used vehicle sales operation with  
25 vehicle repair accessory to the vehicle sales; the vehicle sales



1 at 24450 Telegraph. The review standards of proposed use will  
2 be of such size and character. It will be in harmony with  
3 appropriate and the orderly development of the industrial  
4 district. Location, size, intensity, periods of operation,  
5 designed to eliminate any possible nuisance that may emanate.  
6 The proposed use is in accord with the spirit and purpose of the  
7 Chapter and not inconsistent with the subjectives or principles  
8 of sound planning. Proposed use is a character of vehicle  
9 traffic generally would not be have an adverse effect or be  
10 detrimental to surrounding land uses or adjacent thoroughfares.  
11 Proposed use is such character intensity and arranged so as to  
12 eliminate any adverse effects resulting from noise, dust, dirt,  
13 glare, oil, or fumes. And proposed use is not to be adverse to  
14 promotion of health, safety and welfare of the community. As  
15 usual, the approval is based on the documents, facts,  
16 representations and stipulations submitted with the application  
17 and placed on the record at the public hearing.

18           There are a couple of conditions. Approval of the  
19 site plan by the City Planner. This is in the I1 District, so  
20 it's an administrative site plan. And continuous compliance  
21 with all applicable ordinances, codes, laws, and statutes. The  
22 petitioner must perform all work under plans, permits and file  
23 inspections approved by the City of Southfield. And hours of  
24 operation as suggested at the last meeting that we had on this,  
25 hours of operation Monday through Saturday, 9 a.m. to 6 p.m.

1 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

2 Looking for a recommendation on PSLU23-0013 from the  
3 Commission?

4 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Through the chair, I'd like to  
5 motion that we accept the favorable recommendation  
6 recommendation for PSLU23-0013.

7 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Support.

8 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. We've got a favorable  
9 recommendation by Dr. Stephens-Gunn, supported by Commissioner  
10 Willis. All in favor?

11 (All in favor.)

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Opposed? None.

13 Congratulations. Thank you.

14 MR. SEMMA: Thank you very much.

15 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. Moving down  
16 Telegraph Road a little further, I think, to 23055 Telegraph  
17 Road, onto the opposite side.

18 MR. PAISON: Yes, Mr. Chairman. This is a proposal  
19 at, sort of, at the corner of 9 Mile and Telegraph. It's an  
20 L-shaped lot, so it does have frontage on both roads, but it  
21 doesn't actually occupy the corner itself. It is a vacant  
22 branch bank with a drive -- it had drive-through windows.  
23 They're looking to demolish this and redevelop the site for a  
24 automatic car wash, conveyor-type car wash. The proposed hours  
25 of operation that were discussed at the first meeting this month

1 were Monday through Friday, 7 a.m. to 7 p.m. Saturday, Sunday,  
2 7 a.m. to 8 p.m., and they might be shorter depending on weather  
3 and season, but this was the longer version of the hours.

4           It's just a site aerial here kind of showing the  
5 immediately neighboring properties. You got a little strip  
6 center and a drive-through next door. This is the existing  
7 building from Telegraph, kind of straight on and a little bit  
8 from the north. You got the I1 industrial in the front, and  
9 then you've got a strip of P parking in the rear. The current  
10 zoning in the future land use is the Southfield Technology  
11 Corridor like the last site, which the language allows for a  
12 variety of support uses or supporting commercial uses. The  
13 rezoning, when we get to it, is only for the I1 portion. The P  
14 parking portion of the site is going to remain as it is. This  
15 is the overall site plan. It is colorized. You got to make it  
16 a little easier to read. You can see the landscaping, the car  
17 stacking, the pavement, and the building. As noted, there are  
18 some solar panels up there on the roof toward the back, those  
19 eight rectangles. There are EV charging stations along the  
20 north side there, vacuum stations along the building.

21           A little bit closer view, you can see the handicap  
22 parking near the actual like entrance to the -- to go inside.  
23 There's bike racks. It has got drains at the exit. And they  
24 did establish here at the last meeting that that area of  
25 activity is going to have heated pavement so it doesn't ice up.

1 And we do have a loading area kind of in the bypass lane in the  
2 rear. Also, that's the access to the dumpster enclosure. The  
3 building itself is pretty standard. You come in on the backside  
4 there to the left. And the car wash takes you out to the front.  
5 You got a little customer service area up there toward the front  
6 on the north side. Some office space. Equipment room down both  
7 sides, a little more office space, and the cashier on the  
8 northwest corner, and then that service area.

9 So here's the elevations. These haven't changed since  
10 the last meeting. You've got the south elevation, which is  
11 facing towards the Taco Bell. It's a landscape area. The west  
12 elevation, which is the rear where you'd be entering the car  
13 wash, and the north elevation, which is where your vacuum  
14 stations are and your EV chargers. And then the east elevation,  
15 which is facing Telegraph. We do have an elevation rendering.  
16 And I believe the petitioner is present, if they'd come forward.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Please state your names and  
18 addresses for the record and tell us --

19 MR. RUBINSTEIN: Good evening. My name is Jan  
20 Rubinstein, and I'm an attorney assisting Mr. Dano, the property  
21 owner. My address is 30665 Northwestern Highway, Farmington  
22 Hills, Michigan 48334.

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

24 MR. RUBINSTEIN: So I just wanted to make a couple of  
25 comments, and I'll turn this over to Mr. Dano. Also, standing

1 to my left is John Gumma, he's the designer of the project. I  
2 just want to thank you for allowing us to be here tonight.

3 We're hopeful to receive a recommendation for this car  
4 wash. This property has not been in use for several years, and  
5 the intention is to create a positive revenue producing valuable  
6 parcel in this spot. It's a unique project, in my opinion.  
7 It's got a blend of technology and environmental responsibility.  
8 The design was intended to minimize or eliminate any negative  
9 impact to the surrounding community. Standing to my left, as I  
10 said, is Art Dano. He's the property owner. He's owned the  
11 property since, I believe 2018.

12 MR. DANO: Actually 2020.

13 MR. RUBINSTEIN: 2020. I'm sorry. And John Gumma.  
14 Mr. Gumma can probably answer more of the questions on the  
15 operational design features, and Mr. Dano can answer any  
16 questions about the property itself and why he wishes to pursue  
17 this project.

18 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay.

19 MR. RUBINSTEIN: Thank you for your time.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So we've got two public  
21 hearings on this item?

22 MR. PAISON: Yes. Mr. Chairman, you got the rezoning  
23 public hearing, which we then act on. And then you would go to  
24 the special land use public hearing and then act on that issue  
25 and then the site plan.

1 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. If you guys could step  
2 to the side, but hang out, there may be questions.

3 At this time. This is a public hearing for the  
4 rezoning portion, PZR 23-004. I'll open the public hearing at  
5 this time. If anyone would like to come forward and speak on  
6 this project, please approach. Seeing none, we'll close the  
7 public hearing and open up to the Commission for discussion on  
8 the rezoning of the site.

9 Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

10 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Well, I have a question, but I'm  
11 not sure if it's rezoning or special use.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay.

13 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: So I want to ask the question and  
14 then we'll figure it out. My question is after they come  
15 through the automated wash, is it towel dry or is it the kind  
16 that just sucks all the water off? Which kind of drying  
17 mechanism are you going to use?

18 DIRECTOR CROAD: If I could, I'm going to ask you to  
19 hold on answering that. That's more of a special land use  
20 question.

21 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay.

22 DIRECTOR CROAD: We're just considering the merits of  
23 rezoning from I1 to B3 three at this time.

24 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. If it's regarding rezoning,  
25 I think it's an excellent use for that current property. Thank

1 you.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

3 Mr. Martin?

4 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I also think it's an excellent  
5 use property.

6 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: And I have no questions.

7 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Gruber?

8 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: I have no questions.

9 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: I have no questions.

10 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No questions. It's an  
11 excellent property for this.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. We'll, it's  
13 Telegraph Road. The sites never seem to be zoned for what you  
14 want to use them for anyway, so I'd be in favor of rezoning this  
15 to a B3 so you can redevelop the site.

16 The Planning Department, do you have a recommendation?

17 MR. PAISON: Yes, Mr. Chairman. Planning Department  
18 recommends a favorable recommendation of PZR23-0004 to rezone  
19 1.25 acres of land, that front portion at 23055 Telegraph Road  
20 from I1 industrial to B3 general business for the following  
21 reasons: The Southfield Comprehensive Master Plan indicates the  
22 Southfield Technology Coordinator designation for this property,  
23 which is a mixed use subarea, which specifically calls for  
24 interspersed commercial to support the planned high tech office  
25 and research intended to be the primary use. The proposed

1 rezoning of the B3 general business will allow the redevelopment  
2 of the vacant former branch banks building and site. Additional  
3 uses permitted by the rezoning would be compatible with other  
4 auto-oriented commercial uses that dominate this part Telegraph  
5 Road.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

7 Commissioners, I'm looking for a motion on the  
8 rezoning aspect of the project.

9 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Through the Chair, I'd like  
10 to move that we accept the recommend -- favorable recommendation  
11 for PVR23-0004.

12 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: I second it.

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We've got a favorable  
14 recommendation by Commissioner Goodwin-Dye, supported by  
15 Commissioner Bernoudy. All in favor?

16 (All in favor.)

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any opposed? None. Thank you.

18 All right. So the rezoning is favorable. The next  
19 aspect is the PSLU23-0019, the special use aspect of this  
20 project.

21 MR. PAISON: Call the public hearing for that.

22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. This is another public  
23 hearing. If you would actually step to the side. If any public  
24 here wishes to speak on this item please approach. Seeing none,  
25 we'll close the public hearing. Move on to the Commission. Dr.



1 Stephens-Gunn, comments?

2 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Now I can ask my towel dry  
3 question.

4 MR. GUMMA: Good evening. My name is John Gumma, 7419  
5 Middlebelt Road, West Bloomfield. We are responsible for  
6 providing these drawings. Yes, it will be towel dried.

7 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Okay. Thank you.

8 MR. PAISON: Do you mean like actual people standing  
9 there with towels, or you mean like the rotating drums and the  
10 blowers?

11 MR. GUMMA: No. At the end of the tunnel, after the  
12 drums and the blowers, you will have actual people there.

13 MR. PAISON: Okay.

14 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you.

15 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Martin?

16 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You stated your hours would be  
17 till 7 p.m. I believe. For the wintertime I can understand that  
18 because of the darkness, but in the summertime, it looks like,  
19 you know, you have 8, 9 o'clock before it gets dark. Is there  
20 any consideration for changing the hours. We need the hours  
21 stated in the --

22 MR. GUMMA: I don't think we mind extending the hours.  
23 You're asking to extend the hours for later in the p.m.?

24 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Well, I'm just asking if you'd  
25 be using them beyond 7 o'clock in the summertime?

1 MR. GUMMA: Yes. We would love to. I don't really  
2 don't know the true --

3 MR. DANO: Sorry. I'm Art Dano. I'm the owner of the  
4 building. We were, in the summer, it would probably be until 8  
5 o'clock, depending on if the sun is still up.

6 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: The reason I ask is it needs to  
7 be stated in the plan, the total hours. So, you know, I  
8 understand that you can have shorter hours in the winter, but  
9 you need to state the maximum hours so that you can vary for  
10 season?

11 MR. DANO: Yes, sir. About two weeks ago when we were  
12 here, we did talk a -- we touched a little bit about that,  
13 extending hours in the summer.

14 MR. GUMMA: Sunset.

15 MR. DANO: Sunset, yeah.

16 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Hours. You have to give time.  
17 Is that correct?

18 DIRECTOR CROAD: Yes. And currently because this is a  
19 special land use, yeah, we can regulate the hours. Currently  
20 you had listed it's Monday through Friday, 7 a.m. to 7 p.m. and  
21 Saturday through Sunday, 7 a.m. to 8 p.m.

22 MR. GUMMA: We can stay consistent to a 8 p.m. in the  
23 weekdays as well during the summer hours.

24 DIRECTOR CROAD: Okay. It's just when they make the  
25 recommendation it's going to be subject to that. You're going

1 to have to be holding to those hours.

2 MR. GUMMA: Sure.

3 DIRECTOR CROAD: So you're asking for a 7 a.m. to 8  
4 p.m. basically seven days a week?

5 MR. DANO: Yeah.

6 MR. GUMMA: Yes, please.

7 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: That was all.

8 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Willis?

9 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I understand when you wash a  
10 vehicle you filter the water and use it to rewash the next car  
11 to a degree?

12 MR. GUMMA: Yes. It is recycled.

13 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. With the salt or whatever  
14 comes off the car, where does that wastewater go?

15 MR. GUMMA: So there's a lint interceptor in the  
16 filtration system that mud, any debris in your wheel well, you  
17 know you may have some mud, and it all gets collected into a  
18 like a barrel, which is called a lint interceptor, kind of like  
19 the gas stations have it there is any overflow when you're  
20 fueling your guess and you get a little bit of spillage, and  
21 it's a series of filters that collects it before it goes to the  
22 recycling filtration system. And then depending on the volume  
23 of your station -- on the car wash, it's picked up weekly,  
24 monthly, something like that, biweekly. And that's just like a  
25 big drum. Usually you see them, steel barrels, or plastic

1 barrels.

2 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. None is left onsite.  
3 There's no threat of it going into groundwater?

4 MR. GUMMA: No, absolutely not.

5 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Gruber?

7 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: No questions.

8 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye?

9 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: I'm looking at the diagram.  
10 I brought this up last time. You have, right at the end of the  
11 car wash where they're coming up, you have two arrows,  
12 directional arrows coming into the drive. That's not going to  
13 cause a problem?

14 MR. GUMMA: No, because you kind of like train your  
15 customers to -- you still have to have two arrows on the in if  
16 somebody's coming to get a complimentary vacuum and then they  
17 don't want to get a car wash and they just exit. But most of  
18 your -- I would say 90, 95% of your people come in, vacuum, back  
19 up and go through the tunnel.

20 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Back up and go through the  
21 tunnel. That means they have --

22 MR. GUMMA: Oh, you know, like come in and go through  
23 the tunnel to come up.

24 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: They have to go out on the  
25 street and come all the way back around?

1 MR. GUMMA: No. There is no street. You circulate  
2 around.

3 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Okay. What I'm seeing is  
4 these two arrows here. This is at the end, right? This is  
5 where they're coming out, correct?

6 MR. DANO: No, they come out through here.

7 MR. GUMMA: No, that's the in.

8 MR. DANO: This is the exit.

9 MR. PAISON: This is the exit.

10 MR. DANO: The out is to the right?

11 MR. PAISON: This is entry.

12 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: That's entry. Okay. All  
13 right. Then I'm reading it wrong?

14 MR. PAISON: Yes.

15 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: Gotcha. Thank you.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Bernoudy?

17 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: No questions. I'm looking  
18 forward to it, though.

19 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

20 My question is probably a mix of site plan and special  
21 use, but there's been several car washes lately come through the  
22 City. This one looks a little different, at least in color of  
23 the building.

24 Can you maybe expound upon, like, the features of this  
25 car wash? I know you had some green features like solar panels

1 I thought were kind of interesting. And just explain a little  
2 bit more why another car wash -- why the type of car wash that  
3 you're proposing, just to help understand.

4 MR. GUMMA: So this is a full service car wash. You  
5 have many options as far as getting -- it depends what kind of  
6 package. You either can get paid for monthly or a per use  
7 basis. You can go in there and get your car wash, fully  
8 detailed, interior. You know, Uber and all that is all very  
9 popular now, so they go in there and they get their car detailed  
10 from the inside. For the -- and it's all sanitary, sanitized,  
11 clean, vacuumed, and then it goes through the tunnel to get it  
12 washed, or you can just go straight through the car wash for a  
13 wash only.

14 Yes, we do have EV chargers. We do have solar panels.  
15 We're trying to be ahead of the game here. Energy efficiency.  
16 At the end of the tunnel, it is -- we have a boiler system that  
17 is heated pavement. So like a couple of weeks ago, 22 below  
18 zero, all that salt that's in your car, and when a car comes --  
19 the vehicle comes out of the tunnel, it's dripping water and  
20 it's 22 below wind chill, it freezes up instantly, so that's a  
21 heated pavement with a trench drain in there. So all the access  
22 water goes into that trench -- that trench drain, and gets  
23 recycled and get -- and goes out as well.

24 We're going to have the -- the vacuums for the  
25 vehicles are uniquely designed. So it has one big kind of like

1 a suction vacuum that's inside the facility that we don't have  
2 individual vacuums at each individual station, in a sense. You  
3 have collectors at the station, but the main sound of it, the --  
4 what do you call it -- suction, is inside the building, so it's  
5 a very quiet type of vacuum.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: That's interesting. That's the  
7 first I've heard that.

8 MR. GUMMA: It's kind of like a big compressor in the  
9 building. That's the word I was looking for.

10 MR. DANO: And if I could just chime in. Sorry, John.  
11 I've owned the building for some time. There's been absolutely  
12 no movement. I've maintained it, the outside, because I'm real  
13 particular with that and kept it, you know, nice and clean and  
14 organized. And I just feel like it's a great spot for it,  
15 especially coming off of 9 Mile as well as Telegraph, and I  
16 think it'll definitely be a positive asset to the City.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yeah. There's a lot of vacant  
18 banks around that need to be reused somehow or rebuilt or  
19 redeveloped. So I think this can --

20 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: May I ask a question? Just out  
21 of curiosity, are you hoping this will be the first of several  
22 car washes.

23 MR. DANO: That's the plan. So without getting ahead  
24 of myself --

25 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Okay. I was just curious.

1 MR. DANO: Yes. Definitely the plan.

2 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Because we have a lot of empty  
3 banks in Southfield, as you said. Okay.

4 DIRECTOR CROAD: We also have a lot of car washes.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We have a lot of car washes.

6 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: I know we have a lot of -- we  
7 were talking about that last week. We're going to have the  
8 cleanest cars in Michigan right here in Southfield.

9 MR. DANO: Absolutely. I know there's more like 12  
10 Mile area, you know, bigger ones and stuff. There's one on 10  
11 Mile, which is really small. So this will be it.

12 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Yeah. Okay. I was just  
13 curious. Thank you.

14 MR. DANO: Oh, you're welcome. Thank you.

15 MR. BOLLIN: If I may, through the Chair, just for my  
16 own curiosity, do you plan on having the vacuums free use or  
17 membership only.

18 MR. DANO: Complimentary.

19 MR. BOLLIN: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Willis?

21 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yeah. You mentioned detailing.  
22 Where is the detailing going to be done for the interior?

23 MR. GUMMA: Go to the floor plan, if you don't mind,  
24 please. Right there. So that tunnel you have where it says  
25 5,245 that met -- right there, yes. So the cars would go to the



1 side. The tunnel actually doesn't -- the car wash tunnel  
2 doesn't actually start until about where the A is going to be,  
3 between the G and the A, that's where the actual physical  
4 washing starts. So they would maneuver to the right where that  
5 5,245 is and they would be hand detailed in there, and then they  
6 would go into the circulation of the stacking of the tunnel.

7 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: So, in essence, you're saying  
8 there's two -- an exterior car wash could car for wash could  
9 continue straight and detail and come to the to the right and --

10 MR. GUMMA: You would get your car detailed first, and  
11 then it would go through the tunnel.

12 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. While wash only would  
13 continue through without.

14 MR. GUMMA: Correct. You would just continue on.

15 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay.

16 MR. GUMMA: Yes.

17 DIRECTOR CROAD: Through the Chair, I'm going to ask  
18 that you provide a little more detail before this goes to  
19 Council.

20 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yeah.

21 DIRECTOR CROAD: So you can show a couple parking  
22 spaces, show where the beginning of the car wash is and the  
23 exit.

24 MR. GUMMA: Detail the floor plan a little bit more?

25 DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah.

1 MR. GUMMA: Sure.

2 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yeah. You need to fill that  
3 split so that --

4 MR. GUMMA: Sure.

5 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: -- because when you said detail  
6 that time, you know, we didn't -- I don't think we were familiar  
7 with the detailing in the prior meeting.

8 MR. GUMMA: Sure. And we'll verify that is still the  
9 case.

10 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. And -- go ahead. And  
11 with detailing, I assume that the customer will stay in the  
12 vehicle while you're detailing, or they get out?

13 MR. GUMMA: No. That's where the customer service  
14 area is. You have two areas of customer service area. You have  
15 the bottom left hand corner where the cashier is.

16 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay.

17 MR. GUMMA: That staging area. That's kind of like --  
18 if you want to call it a lounge, waiting room. And that's how  
19 they get -- go in. And after your car is detailed -- I'm sorry  
20 -- after your car is detailed, you would go back into your car  
21 and go through the tunnel.

22 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. So at the entrance by the  
23 cashier, the doorway into the cashier, that's where you're going  
24 to get out of your car and --

25 MR. GUMMA: That's your lounge, correct.

1           COMMISSIONER WILLIS: And that's where you wait while  
2 your car goes through the detailing. And after it's detailed on  
3 the inside, you exit and you get back in your car and then go  
4 through the -- for the rest of the wash?

5           MR. GUMMA: Yes, sir.

6           COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. You need to show that  
7 that's a lounge area, some area for the people to wait. Is  
8 there a lavatory there for customers that are in? You're  
9 bringing up things now that we hadn't thought about because we  
10 weren't aware of the detailing.

11          MR. GUMMA: Sure, sure.

12          COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Director Croad, you had a  
13 question?

14          DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah. I'll let the Commission  
15 finish.

16          COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yeah. So is there a lavatory in  
17 near the detailing area?

18          MR. GUMMA: I will confirm that they -- we are going  
19 to have the detailing. If there isn't I will provide that --

20          DIRECTOR CROAD: It looks like there's a restroom up  
21 at that customer service area.

22          COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yeah. But they're detailing --

23          MR. GUMMA: Yeah.

24          DIRECTOR CROAD: That's one of my concerns is that one  
25 that's not labeled. And then if someone's getting out, how do

1 they get over there safely? And it looks like there's only  
2 doors from the outside. We need more detail on this.

3 MR. GUMMA: Sure. We're not really 100 percent  
4 confirmed with the detailing, but we will by the next, and if  
5 you are, I'll have a detailed floor plan.

6 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Well, so the problem we have is  
7 we have to approve it before it goes to the next process.

8 MR. GUMMA: Gotcha.

9 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: So if we don't have all the  
10 details, if we don't have the I's dotted and the T's crossed  
11 you're not going to get it.

12 MR. GUMMA: No detail.

13 DIRECTOR CROAD: And, again, you could recommend  
14 postponing to a date certain.

15 MR. GUMMA: No detailing.

16 DIRECTOR CROAD: Well, we're still going to need more  
17 clarification on that. That plan is just -- that's one of my  
18 concerns. It's not very clear how things are going to operate.

19 MR. GUMMA: Okay.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: What I'm hearing as a concern  
21 is there's going to be a bunch of cars and a bunch of people  
22 detailing all out in the parking lot and now it turns into  
23 outdoor storage.

24 MR. DANO: That's not the case.

25 MR. GUMMA: This is not -- no detailing.

1           COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: It just, you know, it looks  
2 kind of trashy or whatever. I don't think that's --

3           DIRECTOR CROAD: And I'm concerned about the flow now.  
4 You know, with cars continuing, cars pulling off to the side,  
5 how passengers or customers are safely going to get to these two  
6 areas. I don't think that's very clear.

7           MR. RUBINSTEIN: I think everybody's right, and Art  
8 has just mentioned that the detailing was sort of ancillary to  
9 the main project. The main part of this project is an automatic  
10 car wash, so he's willing to forego any detail if it alleviates  
11 any concerns.

12           DIRECTOR CROAD: Through the Chair, it's not that  
13 we're saying eliminate it, we're saying explain how this is  
14 going to work better in the interior. You still have this big  
15 open space that's unidentified. You stated that the internal  
16 car washing systems going to start about A, and it's not clear  
17 on this.

18           The other customer service area, you have two exterior  
19 ingress and egress doors that don't have any access to the  
20 interior. Just there's some questions here with the flow. And  
21 one of the things that I was going to raise, both positive and  
22 question-wise is, it looks like you're going to have a heated  
23 concrete exit area so to prevent ice.

24           Is the equipment sophisticated enough that if there's  
25 some stacking -- could you go to that site plan, Mr. Paison?

1 Yeah. Next one. So if there's some stacking on the exit there  
2 of the elbow, does the machine automatically shut down from the  
3 inside?

4 MR. GUMMA: Absolutely, yes.

5 DIRECTOR CROAD: And then we've seen enough car  
6 washes, I think Mr. Martin touched on a little bit, what's the  
7 percentage of water that gets recycled? And then how many  
8 gallons of water are you going through in a typical day, versus  
9 what's the average water usage? These are some things that  
10 others have brought up about, hey, we're way ahead of the  
11 industry standard. We only use this amount of water versus the  
12 average. We recycle 90 percent of the water. There's always  
13 some wastage.

14 I think it's worth taking a pause just to get a clear  
15 understanding of how the interior is going to work. I know that  
16 you've got this one-way flow off of 9 Mile. Those trucks are  
17 going to come in, and then the hours of operation for delivery  
18 and drop off, because I can see there's a conflict point, we  
19 usually just want to have a better comfort level on the way this  
20 thing is going to internally operate and as cars are exiting.  
21 And I don't think it's very clear from your floor plan.

22 And then I'd like to get some additional information  
23 on that water usage, number of gallons, what's the average, how  
24 much is recycled, because these are all questions that the  
25 Council will be asking as well.

1           And I thank you for letting me bring these up. It  
2 wasn't clear earlier, at least on my initial review of the floor  
3 plan, how this was going to operate on the inside. And, again,  
4 you could move this forward, subject to us trying to  
5 administratively get all these answers. We got a quick turn  
6 around with Council. I think it would be better to pause, get  
7 all the answers done, make sure it's clear before you make a  
8 recommendation.

9           DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Through the Chair --

10          MR. GRIFFIS: Just real quick before I forget. This  
11 looks like a -- is this a Tommy's Car Wash? Is this like a  
12 national prototype that these floor plan questions are already  
13 answered?

14          MR. GUMMA: No, it is not a Tommy's. It's similar.

15          MR. GRIFFIS: Okay. Is Tommy's the -- this looks like  
16 a Tommy's, right? Sorry.

17          Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

18          DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Director Croad, my concern is that  
19 all of the questions that we raised today will delay this  
20 project at least another month unless we make some modifications  
21 or approve some modifications moving forward. I think these  
22 gentlemen have worked very, very hard to put together a package.  
23 If there is a way that the department can work with them in  
24 order for them to continue to at least be moving forward? I  
25 would like to hear if that is an option, because if they have to

1 go back, we're looking at a whole 'nother month, at least a  
2 month.

3           DIRECTOR CROAD: Again, as I stated, that is an  
4 option. You could defer. You can move this forward subject to  
5 us administratively trying to get these answers settled. It  
6 just -- on -- February is an unusual month with the Council.  
7 They have two meetings the first two weeks, and then they don't  
8 meet again until March, and it's a very quick turnaround. And  
9 as it is, if we advertise, we're going to have to advertise at a  
10 study meeting to get this public hearing on.

11           And with all due respect, and I appreciate the fact  
12 that you're trying to develop this, and we've getting -- we have  
13 received a number of phone calls over the years about different  
14 things, unless -- especially with you being the owner, I think  
15 slowing down by one month is not the end of the world for you  
16 moving forward. And I'd rather have these questions answered.  
17 This is televised. The meeting minutes go to the Council. And  
18 we certainly have the ability professionally to do this, but  
19 with such a quick turnaround, we're basically one week away from  
20 -- one week from Monday presenting this to Council again.

21           MR. PAISON: Yeah. It would appear on Council's  
22 February 5th agenda, and so it's not a lot of time.

23           DIRECTOR CROAD: And so, yes, I -- you know, I'm very  
24 conscious about time is money and moving things along, but there  
25 is a time when a pause is worth the pause. We want this to be



1 successful moving forward. And, again, my recommendation would  
2 be to postpone to a date certain, but you certainly could move  
3 this forward subject to us, our review, which is it's going to  
4 be at Council a week from tomorrow, or Monday.

5 MR. PAISON: A week from Monday.

6 DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah.

7 MR. DANO: I'm sorry. If I can say something. We've  
8 been pretty proactive with Thomas, and, you know, John's been  
9 great, so has Jan getting stuff over in a timely manner, and  
10 what have you so.

11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Dr. Stephens-Gunn, were you  
12 finished?

13 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: I'm done.

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Martin?

15 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You mentioned that there's  
16 heated space coming out of the car wash collecting over the  
17 bottom drainage because, you know, even with towel drying you're  
18 not getting all the water off the car, and there's a grid for  
19 water to go into. Will that water be collected? Is that part  
20 of the recycling process also? And if so, you need to include  
21 that so that it's known in the process also.

22 MR. GUMMA: So the answer is yes, it would be  
23 recycled, and I will include that.

24 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You know, I hate to bring up all  
25 these things, but when you look at it, it -- really the

1 detailing threw everything off because that brings up all the  
2 different concerns that come out and that, you know, that's --  
3 we're trying to do the best we can for the citizens of  
4 Southfield and we came up with the question, so there we go.  
5 I'm done.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioners, any other  
7 comments?

8 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Yeah. I'm in agreement with  
9 Mr. Croad, because you want to set yourself apart from everybody  
10 else, and that detailing sets you apart from everybody else.  
11 And to stop for a second and put that plan together would set  
12 you apart from a lot of other ones. And I think it would be  
13 well worth your money for that.

14 DIRECTOR CROAD: Again, you get -- we made a comment  
15 about the number of car washes that are coming through Planning  
16 Commission and Council. We actually had three requests this  
17 week. We met with a potential new car wash. And these  
18 questions are, you know, valid questions that Council and the  
19 commission and ourselves have concerns on. And as Commissioner  
20 have said, this, offering the detailing is a unique piece to the  
21 -- what we've heard.

22 And, again, I think it's in your best interest to slow  
23 this down, but we'll defer to the planning commission. We  
24 certainly can work with you. It's just a quick turn around.  
25 You'll have to get your plans in right away.

1 MR. PAISON: Yeah, we would have to -- Council would  
2 be a week from Monday. We would need stuff for the Council  
3 packets by next Thursday.

4 DIRECTOR CROAD: And you would need it before then for  
5 us to review.

6 MR. PAISON: Yeah. So we'd need it as soon as  
7 possible, tomorrow or Friday.

8 DIRECTOR CROAD: Really by the end of this week we  
9 would need revise plans.

10 MR. PAISON: Yeah. Just the floor plans we need  
11 revised though mainly.

12 DIRECTOR CROAD: The floor plan.

13 MR. PAISON: If we don't have it by Friday, it  
14 probably isn't a workable timeframe.

15 MR. DANO: I'm sorry. If I could say something, he  
16 said that could have it by Friday if that helps.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So I'm going to leave it  
18 up the majority of the Commission. Do you want to postpone to a  
19 date certain, which would be next month? Do you want to allow  
20 the option to move forward with sending the revised drawings to  
21 the Planning Department? That's the two choices that I'm  
22 hearing.

23 Do we need to listen to the recommendation before we  
24 decide on that, or do we --

25 DIRECTOR CROAD: Well, I would say if you want to move

1 it forward, subject to us, we can read the recommendation into  
2 the record. If you're going to just postpone to a date certain,  
3 there's no need to do that at this time.

4 MR. PAISON: You might want to just call for the  
5 question on whether or not to postpone to a date certain and see  
6 if there's any -- if there's motion in support.

7 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So we'll just take a poll. Who  
8 is -- Commissioner Martin, do you have a question?

9 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Just a question now.

10 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay.

11 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You're saying that if they  
12 provide the stuff that the Planning Department is going to  
13 review it or is it coming back to the Commission?

14 DIRECTOR CROAD: That's what you're deciding. Do you  
15 want to postpone it to a date certain and have them come back to  
16 you, or you could recommend moving forward based on our  
17 recommendations with the additional condition that you defer to  
18 us to administratively review the interior floor plan prior to  
19 Council, because again, it's unusual that Council has two  
20 meetings in the beginning of February and they don't have  
21 another meeting until March, so it's a quick turnaround.

22 And again, we're able to accommodate either schedule.  
23 If you recall we postponed that previous gas station and liquor  
24 because we didn't have enough information. So again, I don't  
25 understand what the sense of urgency is for one month, but we're

1 prepared to do whatever Commission is inclined to recommend.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So to the Commission, who is in  
3 favor of moving forward with the condition that the Planning  
4 Department reviews the revised drawings the next week? Yes or  
5 no?

6 Does that make sense to -- who's in favor of moving  
7 this as scheduled with the review to the planning department?  
8 I'm looking for a yes on that. We'll just go in line.

9 Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

10 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: No.

11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Mr. Martin?

12 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: No.

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Willis?

14 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yes.

15 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Gruber?

16 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Yes.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So now I got to start doing  
18 that.

19 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Sorry.

20 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Two and two.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: No?

22 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No.

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So three noes.

24 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: No.

25 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Four.

1 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Okay. That's it then.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So it's tied. So I have to --  
3 wait, it's four noes?

4 COMMISSIONER GRUBER: Yes. It's four noes. You're  
5 good.

6 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You're good at math normally.

7 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Not today.

8 DIRECTOR CROAD: Could you give him the date? Then  
9 you should recommend postponing to a date certain.

10 MR. PAISON: February 28th would be the next regular  
11 meeting of the Planning Commission.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So the majority has spoken.  
13 We're going to recommend postponing this to a date certain of  
14 February, whatever you just said. So I'm going to look for that  
15 motion from the Commission now.

16 MR. DANO: Did you say February 20th?

17 DIRECTOR CROAD: 28th.

18 MR. PAISON: That's the next regular meeting. You have  
19 a study meeting on the 7th, the CIP study being on the 21st, and  
20 the regular meeting on the 28th.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So this is for PSLU23-0019, the  
22 special land use.

23 DIRECTOR CROAD: And you, if you wanted to, you could  
24 add the site plan review and as part of that motion.

25 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So we're going to also

1 add the postponing -- the site plan review, which is PSP23-0019  
2 to the date certain of February 28th. So I'm looking for that  
3 motion from the Commission.

4 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Through the Chair.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Yes.

6 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Motion we postpone to a date  
7 certain PSR23-0004 and PSLU23-0019 to a date certain of February  
8 28th, 2024.

9 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Support.

10 MR. PAISON: I would intervene. You already voted on  
11 we already voted on the rezoning.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We already voted on the  
13 rezoning.

14 MR. PAISON: You'd be postponing the PSLU and the PSP.

15 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So number 2 and number 3 on the

16 --

17 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I'm sorry. PS -- yeah. Let me  
18 correct that to PSLU23-0019 and PSP23-0019 through date certain.

19 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: And I will still support that.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Do you support it?

21 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. So a motion to  
23 postpone to the date certain by Commissioner Martin, second by  
24 Commissioner Willis for both items, PSLU23-0019 and PSP23-0019.  
25 All in favor?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

(All in favor.)

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. Any opposed? Yes?  
Some opposed. Six to one. All right. So please be in contact  
with the Planning Department to resolve all the items we've  
discussed tonight.

MR. GUMMA: Thank you.

MR. DANO: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

All right. Meeting minutes for December 6th and 13th.

MR. PAISON: We are looking for actual approval of  
these minutes as this your regular meeting for the December  
minutes today.

COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any updates? Any corrections?  
Do I have a motion to approve the minutes as written?

COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Motion to approve the December  
6th, 2023 study meeting and the December 13th regular meeting --  
I'm sorry -- December 13th, 2023 regular meeting of the Planning  
Commission.

COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Just before the support, they've  
already been signed and they signed at the time by the  
secretary?

MR. PAISON: Yeah. We just have to cross through and  
have --

COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Okay. I'm good.

MR. PAISON: -- Ms. Gruber sign.



1 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Thank you. Ms. Gruber signed.  
2 Thank you. Okay.

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Do you support?

4 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I support.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So we got a favorable  
6 recommendation of the minutes by Commissioner Martin, supported  
7 by Commissioner Willis. All in favor?

8 (All in favor.)

9 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Opposed? None.

10 All right. Now is the public comment portion of the  
11 meeting. If any person from the public would like to address  
12 the Commission. Don't we have a sign-in list that we have to go  
13 -- okay. So we do have a sign-in list. First name Mike Semma.  
14 Is Mike here?

15 DIRECTOR CROAD: He was an applicant.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: He was -- okay. Next Hussein  
17 -- Adhal Hussein? No?

18 Jan Ruskin, he was just at the front.

19 Rajiv Sabius. Okay. Come on up. State your name and  
20 address for the record. You'll have three minutes to speak.

21 MR. SABIUS: Rajiv Sabius, 25030 Southfield Road, the  
22 owner of New Abbey Wine and Liquor Shop. Respectfully, I  
23 disagree with the approved that 24848 Southfield got. The  
24 Commission asked the Petitioner if there was any pushback from  
25 neighboring businesses, and they respond with no, and that is

1 not true.

2 I own a neighboring business, and I -- we tried to  
3 reach out to them, and then with no response. And with a  
4 section, here, with a Section 5169, the use permit, subject  
5 special approval, with this standards F and G.

6 So last time we had a bunch of community here, people,  
7 and they said no because of the traffic, of the safety and all  
8 the businesses in that block, they -- they close at 11 p.m., no  
9 more than that because of the safety and the crimes that  
10 happened there.

11 CVS used to open 24 hours, and now they just cut their  
12 hours because of that. A lot of people, they come from neighbor  
13 cities with the problems. One of them is -- my store was, they  
14 tried to broke in, I think, it was last year or two years, 5 in  
15 the morning. And Southfield, it's a highway, and it's easy to  
16 do whatever and just get out of the city so quick from there.

17 At the gas station, about the traffic, at the gas  
18 station, there is a sign no turn on red because it's too much  
19 traffic. It's so hard to get in and out from there. And either  
20 the north side, it's so hard because whoever's coming heading  
21 west, going south, it's there is a lot of traffic there. And I  
22 had some pictures. And you guys know.

23 And, sir, you mentioned last time you don't use  
24 Southfield gas stations. Me either. I'm here every day, but to  
25 my traffic. And last time they said it's going to raise the

1 business 10 percent. I think liquor is a game changer, so it's  
2 going to be more than that. Thank you.

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Perfect timing. Thank you.

4 Any other members of the public? Please state your  
5 name and address.

6 MR. KERNEY: My name is Leo Kerney. I'm at 22400  
7 Lathrup Boulevard. As far as the gas station on the corner, far  
8 as square footage, I mean, you know, y'all said that it had to  
9 be a certain amount of this-and-this. I just want to ask, what  
10 is the square footage of a liquor store? Because you got one up  
11 here off of 10 Mile right in the corner, and it's small. And  
12 this gas station is smaller than what a liquor store is supposed  
13 to be.

14 So is this gas station going to be a gas station, or  
15 it's going to be for the sale pop or liquor because they can't  
16 fill up both. And where I stay at, like he was saying, as far  
17 as the space, it's not a space. It's not enough space. You got  
18 the liquor store here, then you got a restaurant behind it. And  
19 as far as the building here is for a space, this is about how  
20 big the gas station is as far as coming in and going out.

21 And it's going to be more tragedy than anything else,  
22 because if you all drink liquor, or whatnot, and people try to  
23 come in and they want to run in and grab a bottle after they get  
24 off work, or grab a beer when they get off of work. And if they  
25 come into that gas station, it's going to be more accidents

1 there than anything else, because people don't really think when  
2 they want what they want. So I'm more or less like concerned  
3 about my community as far as it's going to be more accidents  
4 here, or it's going to be more thefts here, or whatever else.

5 So it's just my concern about the liquor store on the  
6 corner. You got, just like the little shopping center, somebody  
7 burned that up as far as where we just get our Chinese food from  
8 and everything else. So who's to say, hey, I'm pissed off at  
9 somebody else because I can't get a bottle of liquor, I'm going  
10 to throw a -- somebody will burn this liquor store down. So  
11 it's more or less like up and down.

12 I mean, you already got a liquor store here. You  
13 already got a place across the street that you can get beer  
14 from. And then you gonna try to put a liquor store in a gas  
15 station. Well, you know how it is, too, when you getting gas,  
16 somebody cut you off, get in front of you, it's complications.  
17 So now you got a liquor store here, I'm trying to get liquor.  
18 Then you done cut me off keeping me from getting liquor. It's  
19 going to be a problem.

20 Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

22 DIRECTOR CROAD: Do you have anyone else on the list?

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: No one on the list was here.

24 There was four people on the list, but they all presented. I  
25 think is what it was.

1 Please state your name and address for the record.

2 MS. MEDLEY: Debra Walton Medley. My address is 17252  
3 Hilton Street. And I just wanted to come in and see what the  
4 Planning Commission was all about and see what type of  
5 discussions that were held. And low and behold, you're having a  
6 conversation about liquor at -- in my neighborhood right in my  
7 corner. So I wanted to add my input and say that I do not -- I  
8 would not like to have liquor being sold at the gas station at  
9 10 Mile and Southfield.

10 As was previously stated, it's too much traffic.  
11 There's other venues that sell alcohol there. When you are  
12 traveling on 10 Mile at the light to make -- to go south on  
13 Southfield, the traffic backs up. There's no reasonable exit  
14 for a lot of traffic to come out of that gas station. What ends  
15 up happening is people come out of the gas station, they go and  
16 make right, and they go down Lathrup.

17 So now you're going to have folks that are buying  
18 alcohol driving through the neighborhood, impacting the  
19 residents in that neighborhood, children in that neighborhood,  
20 just so that they can get back to Southfield Road or to go  
21 through a different direction, because most often folks are  
22 trying to drive either northbound or southbound on Southfield  
23 Road. And 10 Mile gets very heavy, especially also when there  
24 are accidents on 696. People tend to jump off at Greenfield to  
25 come down 10 Mile to get to Southfield. It's too much traffic,

1 and it just would be horrible. So I just wanted to give my  
2 input.

3 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

4 Hello. Please state your name and address.

5 MR. ATISHA: Andy Atisha, 25000 Southfield up to 100.  
6 I'm the owner of The Plaza across the street from the gas  
7 station. There is liquor license -- is going to be three liquor  
8 license, which is too much. And there is also a dollar store,  
9 which is closed right now. And it's too many license in one  
10 corner that's like in 300 feet around. And I don't see it  
11 anywhere else. It'll be four, that's too many.

12 Anywhere in Southfield or anywhere in Detroit, there  
13 is not that many license, or in Michigan. That's too many  
14 license, that's why I'm going against it because I don't like to  
15 have my property value less with people hang around and drinking  
16 and, you know, asking for money. Give me quarter, give me a  
17 dollar. That's too much. And that's why I'm against it. I  
18 like to have the value property goes up, not drop it down with  
19 alcoholic people. Thank you.

20 DIRECTOR CROAD: Excuse me, sir. Could you give me  
21 the address of your retail again? Are you to the north or west?

22 MR. ATISHA: I'm at Unique Lady, the plaza right  
23 across the street, and it goes up to the barber shop and the  
24 perfume.

25 DIRECTOR CROAD: Is there a liquor store in your

1 retail?

2 MR. ATISHA: Yes, there is a liquor store already.

3 DIRECTOR CROAD: All right. When you said across the  
4 street, I was a little confused.

5 MR. ATISHA: From the gas station.

6 DIRECTOR CROAD: So you're the one with the existing  
7 liquor store?

8 MR. ATISHA: Right.

9 DIRECTOR CROAD: Okay. Thank you.

10 MR. ATISHA: I'm not the owner, I'm the landlord.

11 DIRECTOR CROAD: No, I understand now. I just -- when  
12 you said across the street, I was thinking about where they had  
13 the fire.

14 MR. ATISHA: There is CVS.

15 DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah, I got it now. Thank you.

16 MR. ATISHA: Yeah. The other store.

17 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Anyone else from the public  
18 like to speak? Please state your name and address for the  
19 record.

20 MS. TERRY: Hello. My name is Rita Terry, 18231  
21 Fillmore, Southfield, Michigan, 48075. I've been a resident of  
22 Southfield for over 43 years, and I respectfully decline having  
23 a liquor license at that gas station. Basically, I see people  
24 walking through my neighborhood in the middle of the night, and  
25 I think when the summer comes, there are going to be people

1 parking and parking lots surrounding that gas station drinking.

2 And Southfield is already overburdened with crime as  
3 it is, and I don't think that by that gas station being the only  
4 thing that's going to be open that time of night, and that's  
5 going to bring extra problems and extra unnecessary trouble to  
6 the area where we don't need that situation, and to have  
7 Southfield to be overburdened to have to already deal with the  
8 trouble that we're already dealing with, and then they have to  
9 come and deal with people that's going to be parking and  
10 drinking that we do not need.

11 We're trying to keep Southfield safe and not have it  
12 to be overridden with people drinking and doing unnecessary  
13 partying, and then we're going to have to deal with robberies  
14 and everything else. So I respectfully think that we do not  
15 need to have them open at 2, 3 o'clock in the morning selling  
16 alcohol to people that is going to be committing crimes and  
17 robbing and breaking into people homes. Thank you.

18 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any additional public comments?  
19 Please state your name and address for the record.

20 MR. LAURI: Dura Lauri, 24535 North Carolina Street,  
21 48075. It's like everyone was saying, by them going to have a  
22 liquor license in our community is not going to work. You have  
23 New Abbey, you have CVS, and then you want to have liquor -- a  
24 gas that's selling liquor in a same community. There's no --  
25 traffic is just too bearing. You know, it's accidents all the



1 time. We -- you know, we got people flying up and down, you  
2 know, Southfield, 10 Mile. You know, we don't need it. Our  
3 community really don't need it. Thank you.

4 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

5 I believe that's all the public present. Any  
6 additional comments?

7 MR. SAMONA: My name is Randy Samona. My address is  
8 4196 15 Mile Road in Sterling Heights, Michigan, here on behalf  
9 of the owner of the establishment. Also, here on behalf of my  
10 aunt who lives at 28586 Selkirk Street in Southfield. She  
11 doesn't speak English. I have spoken with her about this issue  
12 in regards to --

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Sir.

14 MR. SAMONA: Yeah.

15 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Could the members of the public  
16 please respect the speaker? Thank you.

17 MR. SAMONA: Thank you. I appreciate that. So,  
18 again, respectfully, we disagree with the Commission's decision  
19 today to approve the proposed special use and site plan with  
20 regard to the gas station that's asking to add liquor located  
21 over at 24848 Southfield Road.

22 Again, just making some comparisons, I was listening  
23 to the hearing that was held today with regards to the car  
24 washing, and madam explained that you were very excited for that  
25 business to open. I just didn't feel that sentiment with the

1 gas station and asking for liquor was up before this Commission.  
2 It didn't seem like it was anything that was in the interest of  
3 the citizens of the city of Southfield.

4 And, sir, that was one of the points that you had made  
5 when you were talking to the car wash. You want to do what's  
6 best for the citizens of the city of Southfield.

7 With all respect to the Petitioner in this matter, his  
8 reasons for adding liquor to the establishment are all self  
9 serving. There's nothing that would benefit the city of  
10 Southfield. I'm sure there would be tax revenue, but, again,  
11 it's really at the detriment of the citizens of the City of  
12 Southfield.

13 And, again, there was just I looked at the points that  
14 are there. And point number four, with regards to the criteria  
15 specifically says, the proposed uses is of such character and  
16 the vehicular traffic generated will not have an adverse effect  
17 or be detrimental to the surrounding land uses or adjacent  
18 thoroughfares. And on the 13th, citizens of Southfield came in  
19 spades to really establish that point.

20 Again, I respect the decision that was made today;  
21 however, given the -- I don't know what information was  
22 presented before the Commission, or if there was any role in the  
23 Commission in looking at what the traffic patterns were or what  
24 the alcohol outlet density is and how it affects certain, you  
25 know, surrounding residents.

1           A lot of it, I guess, begs for transparency in the  
2 process with regards to really explaining how each of those  
3 listed criteria was met. On the 13th, and even as of today, I  
4 just heard, you know, the list and just saying that this  
5 business meets these requirements, but there was no -- the  
6 burden of proof wasn't really met. It's just -- again, there  
7 may be documents that I haven't been made privy to, but  
8 residents at the city of Southfield came today to express their  
9 thoughts, and on the 13th, and they really oppose. So I hope  
10 you consider that. Thank you.

11           COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you.

12           All right. At this time we will close the public  
13 comment portion of the meeting and we are down to the Council  
14 items update.

15           MR. PAISON: There hasn't been a Council meeting since  
16 your last meeting, so I don't have any specific Council items.

17           COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Miscellaneous. The  
18 Planning Commission annual report first.

19           DIRECTOR CROAD: Good evening. Many of you have seen  
20 a similar presentation before, but wanted to do this for the  
21 benefit of the public, and before we submit this to the City  
22 Council. But the Michigan Planning Enabling Act requires that a  
23 Planning Commission shall make an annual written report to the  
24 legislative body concerning its operations and the status of  
25 planning activities, including recommendations regarding actions

1 by the legislative body related to planning and development.

2 Our organization on the left is the members of the  
3 Planning Commission. On the right are the planning department  
4 team. Mr. Paison was added in May, as Mr. Spence, who had been  
5 here 32 years retired, and Mr. Bollin moved from a part-time  
6 probational to a full-time team member of the Planning  
7 Department.

8 In 2023, there was 24 Planning Commission meetings  
9 held, including 10 study meetings, 12 regular meetings, and two  
10 long range meetings. In addition to that, Planning Department  
11 staff supported ten City Center Advisory board meetings, ten  
12 Southfield Public Art Commission meetings, five Sustainable  
13 Southfield Advisory board meetings and six Zoning Board of  
14 Appeal meetings with commercial cases.

15 There are a number of zoning ordinance amendments, as  
16 you're aware. I'll just highlight a few. One of the big ones  
17 is the Northland overlay development district expanded to  
18 include 16025 Northland Drive, which is the Costco business  
19 center, which is the first of its kind in Michigan and has its  
20 grand opening tomorrow at 7 a.m. There is a ribbon cutting, if  
21 you're so inclined to go.

22 We also dealt with liquor sales at gas stations, per  
23 City Council's direction. Exterior ice chest, fence regulations  
24 were updated. We added heavy equipment sales and rental as a  
25 special use in the industrial district. We amended the

1 ordinance to allow for public art to be permitted in the front  
2 yard. We also updated the standards for smoking lounge, and a  
3 number of amendments.

4           Planning Commission and department activities also  
5 include a joint visioning session with the Planning Commission  
6 and city Council last April. We intend to have another one this  
7 spring. Our yearly capital improvement plan update, which we'll  
8 have on -- on your schedule for next month. And then our  
9 department in the last year-and-a-half has really seen a major  
10 transition from institutional knowledge and people who've been  
11 here 20, 30 years to some new staff bringing some new ideas and  
12 perspective. We held our second successful LTU summer camp, and  
13 we plan to have a third one this year. And issues with regards  
14 to keeping of chickens, we will be investigating urban  
15 agriculture and other professional offices permitted in the B  
16 zoning.

17           Another item that we did kind of outside the norm, Mr.  
18 Wicoff, who used to write planning and zoning news for decades,  
19 retired, and he made a donation of all his archives and  
20 magazines to Grand Valley State University. That included a  
21 couple historical planning documents for the City of Southfield.  
22 So they reached out to us and said, do you have any additional  
23 material that you would like to donate to the archives that will  
24 make available to the public, to the world, to any researchers.  
25 And in my 13-and-a-half year tenure, I've been finding old

1 copies of things in corner offices. Former councilman, Forcasi,  
2 would drop things off.

3 We never had a real unified library of historic  
4 documents when we were trying to investigate why certain things  
5 were a certain way in zoning. We were able to compile this  
6 comprehensive list of historic documents and deliver them to the  
7 university. And we will continue making duplicates or sending  
8 extra copies to expand their library, and they're very  
9 appreciative of this. But this was also a good exercise for us,  
10 to be able to compile all the documents from my predecessors  
11 forward.

12 We also, through the help of Suzanne Hanna, who's  
13 leading our sustainability outreach, she held several internal  
14 sustainability task force meetings made up of employees from  
15 various departments, external sustainability community advisory  
16 board made up of various stakeholders. She helped with  
17 promotion and outreach, updated the sustainable Southfield  
18 website, launched a public survey, coordinated with Lawrence  
19 Tech staff on a student survey, brought them Make Food Not Waste  
20 pilot program to the city of Southfield. We are the first ones  
21 in the state of Michigan, I believe in the country, being funded  
22 by the EPA and Eagle, and we're going to be the test pilot for  
23 reducing food waste.

24 We handed out reusable grocery bags and bamboo kitchen  
25 as swag to encourage recycling. Applied for DTE tree energy

1 grant, signed up for EV smart program. They assisted with the  
2 modern butterfly sculpture and pollinator garden at E Corp.

3 Another pilot program that we had a update on to  
4 today is the APT solar bollards that are motion activated and  
5 solar powered. There's 20 of them as shown along the City  
6 Center Trail, and they're getting invaluable information from  
7 us. They said we're the -- a great partner, and they're  
8 learning an awful lot. And we hope that if this is successful,  
9 that once they get manufactured and upgraded, based on the  
10 study, that we'll continue putting these throughout the city.

11 Another focus of ours has been improving pedestrian  
12 enhancements and encouraging public transit usage through  
13 pedestrian amenities, including additional accessible pavement,  
14 benches, trash receptacles, 11 new respite areas along our  
15 pathways were installed. We talked about the solar bollards.  
16 Three bike repair -- three additional bike repair stations and  
17 three additional dog treat stations were installed.

18 And then we take train training and education very  
19 serious. I attended the national planning conference in  
20 Philadelphia, a list of workshops and tours that I attended. We  
21 presented at the National Brownfield Conference, and we talked  
22 about the Northland redevelopment, which was very well received.  
23 We also presented at the Semcon General Assembly Meeting,  
24 several Oakland county events, and then a number of our team  
25 attended the Michigan Association of Planning Annual Conference,

1 as well as a number of webinars on transportation, planning,  
2 zoning, and so forth. With regard to activities, we had 1  
3 rezoning process for conditional re-zonings process, 17 special  
4 land use, 19 site plans, 1 overlay development district, 6 text  
5 amendments, and 46 administrative site plans process.

6 Our total proposed development cost was about  
7 78,000,000. Now, that was down from 2022, but Middle Point  
8 project across the street represented 250,000 of that  
9 300,000,000, so we really had a net increase of about 50 percent  
10 of development costs.

11 And I just quickly highlight some of the major  
12 projects. We had the Clean Express Car Wash, Culver's  
13 Restaurant, Habitat for Humanities duplex. We had the Northland  
14 Storage ODD, which took the former AT&T building and repurposed  
15 that with potential out parcel mixed-use development in the  
16 future.

17 Jasmine Square, many of you have been around for a  
18 while. We've seen many different attempts to find a viable  
19 alternative for that vacant property and hopeful that Jasmine  
20 Square will move forward. The Callister Machinery relocated  
21 their headquarters here on Telegraph Road, and we made an  
22 amendment to allow for that type of use.

23 We had The Matic Auto Wash repurposing an old  
24 antiquated used car dealership. And then we had the gas station  
25 on Northwestern and 12 Mile. We also had a former Baco



1 Restaurant approved as a cigar bar and private club. And then  
2 our DPW was building a new storage building. We made sure that  
3 the use was in compliance with the ordinance and that they got  
4 their first site plan approval in 50 years.

5           And then as far as initiatives this year, I'll just do  
6 a high level. There are our housing, including accessory  
7 dwelling units and tiny homes we'll be looking at. Emphasis on  
8 missing middle housing reuse and mixed use. Continuing to  
9 develop our trail network, including the 9 Mile Greenway  
10 Corridor and the Rouge River Trail. Green Road beautification  
11 we're working in partnership with Oak Park and our new DDA  
12 director. We're also working with parks and rec on a dog park.

13           We have several zoning amendments that we mentioned,  
14 including urban agriculture, will be reviewing and reporting to  
15 the legislative committee coming up here in February, end of  
16 January, and then review of potential consolidation of similar  
17 zoning districts that Mr. Paison's been working on. And then to  
18 continue being eligible for redevelopment ready certification.

19           We also be presenting elimination of the site plan  
20 review at the Council level and having Planning Commission have  
21 the ability to do that. And we are also going to be scheduling  
22 a joint visiting session with the City Council sometime this  
23 spring, early summer.

24           I had Mr. Paison add this. We're constantly trying to  
25 keep track of trends, and this seven trends are things that have

1 been compiled by The National Planning Association to let all  
2 local planners know what's coming down the pipe. So we're not  
3 surprised to find out that office, the whole office worker thing  
4 has changed, but I heard this morning that they're saying about  
5 50 percent now of office workers are coming back five days a  
6 week. But there is, in many cases, a lot of hybrid and young  
7 professionals still prefer the flexibility working from home.  
8 They don't like the long commute. So that hasn't changed.

9           Climate related displacement. Every time we turn on  
10 the news nowadays, you see major floods, major snow, major  
11 storms, and that's impacting all of us, even in places that  
12 never had that before.

13           We're seeing more auto centric planning, driving  
14 inequities. Made in America's making a come back. Even rebirth  
15 of extinct species. We're trying to promote the regrowth of  
16 population of our Monarch butterfly, who's seen a 90 percent  
17 decline. And everything we've read is found that urban way  
18 stations and urban gardens are the best way to protect and grow  
19 the pollinators because the land has pretty much already been  
20 developed, and we don't use the type of pesticides that have  
21 been killing off our pollinators like we do in some of our rural  
22 areas.

23           And then robotics are becoming a part of our everyday  
24 life, from food delivery to nursing to other things. So we're  
25 constantly keeping an eye on national and global trends and to

1 stay flexible and be proactive at the local level.

2           So that -- with that, that's our summary. With your  
3 blessing, we hope to present this at one of the February  
4 Planning Commission -- or Council meetings. And I'd be happy to  
5 answer any questions or take comments from you at this time.  
6 Thank you.

7           COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Thank you. Mr. Martin?

8           COMMISSIONER MARTIN: On page eight, there's a comment  
9 from Michigan Association of Planning where it has Commissioners  
10 Bernoudy and Martin. Would you please remove that line?

11           DIRECTOR CROAD: Eight?

12           COMMISSIONER MARTIN: It's the only line where  
13 individuals on the Planning Commission are listed, and there's  
14 no need. When I provided that information about the training  
15 session we attended, I just identified to go along with the  
16 documentation that was provided and didn't want us to be pointed  
17 out. No one is listed in the other comments.

18           MR. PAISON: Yes, sir.

19           DIRECTOR CROAD: Did you get that Mr. Paision?

20           MR. PAISON: Yes, I did. I see the line right there,  
21 yeah.

22           COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Other than that, I think  
23 report's good.

24           DIRECTOR CROAD: Dr. Stephens-Gunn?

25           DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Director Croad, on your Planning

1 Commission meeting list, could you add the joint meeting that we  
2 had with the City Council? I think that that was a very good  
3 meeting, and I'd like for us to -- for that meeting to be  
4 included.

5 DIRECTOR CROAD: Okay. It is included under our  
6 department activities, but we'll move it under the number of  
7 meetings that we had for the year.

8 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Thank you.

9 MR. PAISON: Page 3 -- or page 5, item C under  
10 Planning Commission meetings.

11 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Correct.

12 MR. PAISON: It would be one joint meeting with City  
13 Council.

14 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Yes, please. Thank you.

15 DIRECTOR CROAD: So it's currently under 2023 planning  
16 commission department activities, and we should move that --

17 MR. PAISON: Yeah.

18 DIRECTOR CROAD: -- under the different types of  
19 meetings that we've had.

20 MR. PAISON: Here we go.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Dr. Stephens-Gunn, were you  
22 finished?

23 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: Yes. I don't have anything else.

24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Mr. Willis? Commissioner  
25 Gruber?

1 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: Good job. Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Bernoudy, any  
3 comments or --

4 COMMISSIONER BERNOUDY: Yes, thank you. First of all,  
5 thank you so much for the report. I wanted to make a comment to  
6 the Parks and Recreation Department. I've had a garden at Mary  
7 Thompson for over 20 years, and last year they made so many  
8 improvements that were so noticeable to all of the gardeners  
9 there.

10 In addition, they added a beekeeper, and she had  
11 several boxes there. And over the fall, she was able to do an  
12 event in my building with all of the honey that she brought, and  
13 she said that she had been providing it to other areas around  
14 here. So it's just a really positive thing that I'm sure when  
15 the rest of the residents find out that she's right in the  
16 garden producing honey, it's a win-win thing. So I would just  
17 like for you to let them know we really appreciate it.

18 DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah. Thank you for bringing that to  
19 our attention. We'll let Ms. Hannah know about it, too. But I  
20 did hear about that.

21 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Goodwin-Dye, I  
22 skipped over you. Did you have any comments?

23 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: No.

24 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. Yeah. Great job as  
25 always very, very thorough. And a lot happens in a year in a

1 big city, so it's always good to see. It's been a lot of  
2 changes over the decade-plus I've been seeing this. And it's  
3 always interesting the way, you know, all these seven  
4 need-to-know trends is real interesting, too, to think about.  
5 But, yeah, every year something you never thought of in the past  
6 is coming at us.

7           DIRECTOR CROAD: Yeah. You know, again, I think that  
8 what we do here sometimes is only the tip of the iceberg.  
9 There's a lot of things that go on behind the scenes, and we've  
10 had to deal with the great recession recently, the pandemic, and  
11 then just expedient change in the way we do business,  
12 E-commerce replacing the brick and mortar store, automated and  
13 autonomous vehicles and how they're changing things, our work  
14 life balance, the home occupations. It just it -- I've said  
15 this in the last ten years, there has been exponentially more  
16 growth and change than my previous 35 years in the business. So  
17 we continue to try to do our best we can to be fluid and keep us  
18 relevant and be proactive so that we can be as strong and as  
19 vital of a community as anyone else. Thank you.

20           MR. PAISON: We were looking for a motion to approve  
21 the plan and refer it to Council with the noted changes, if we  
22 could get that.

23           COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Who would like to make that  
24 motion then for the plan to --

25           COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I'm sorry. What was that?

1 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: -- we need to make a favorable  
2 motion to send this.

3 MR. PAISON: This is your report, so you can actually  
4 just approve this and then refer it to council. It's more of a  
5 received and file, but Mr. -- DIRECTOR CROAD is going to  
6 represent there as well.

7 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Okay. So we're looking for a  
8 motion to approve the annual report.

9 MR. PAISON: Yep. That is, this is your report.  
10 Under the law it is your authority to approve the annual report  
11 and then you refer it to Council.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Commissioner Martin?

13 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: I move that we support or  
14 pass the report, our annual report, with any necessary changes.

15 DR. STEPHENS-GUNN: I second.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: All right. We got a favorable  
17 motion by Commissioner Goodwin-Dye, supported by Dr.  
18 Stephens-Gunn. All in favor?

19 (All in favor.)

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any opposed? None.

21 All right. Thank you. So we've already done the  
22 election of officers, obviously, in the beginning. There's a  
23 Planning Commission study meeting February.

24 MR. PAISON: I do need you to approve an amendment to  
25 the Planing Commission schedule. It is in your book. We had to

1 change the May schedule because there were conflicts with the  
2 City Council budget meetings, so there is a copy of a revised  
3 schedule in your packet. It says draft revised at the top under  
4 schedule. If we could get that approved today, then I can get  
5 it forwarded to all the appropriate parties.

6 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So the Commissioner is looking  
7 for a motion to approve the revised meeting schedule.

8 COMMISSIONER GOODWIN-DYE: I move that we approve the  
9 revised planning meeting schedule.

10 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Question.

11 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: We have a question from  
12 Commissioner Martin before we vote.

13 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You said what date was changed  
14 in May?

15 MR. PAISON: The May. We eliminated the middle  
16 meeting and moved the first meeting to May 1st because it was  
17 the second week instead, because we had two meetings that  
18 conflicted with the stuff, the budget meetings.

19 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: You're eliminating the May 15th  
20 meeting?

21 MR. PAISON: Yes, and then moved the 8th to the 1st.

22 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: Okay.

23 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: So remind me, so we have a  
24 favorable motion by Commissioner Goodwin-Dye. Who was my  
25 support on that?



1 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: I support it.

2 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Supported by Commissioner

3 Willis. All in favor of --

4 (All in favor.)

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Any opposed? None. Thank you.

6 Next --

7 MR. PAISON: Just to let you know that we have those  
8 meetings in February. The study meeting on the 7th where we'll  
9 be introducing some new cases; the CIP study meeting, which will  
10 be 3 p.m. on the 21st, which will be we go over initially all of  
11 the capital improvement projects that are proposed to be in the  
12 capital improvement program. And then the regular meeting at  
13 the end of the month on the -- I got a wrong date on there.  
14 Sorry -- February 28th. On there it is January.

15 COMMISSIONER WILLIS: And we got to fix that on the  
16 presentation.

17 DIRECTOR CROAD: Okay. And, again, if you recall the  
18 first CIP study meetings when the departments attend. And  
19 again, I would ask you if you have questions to focus on  
20 planning and zoning related questions, and not get down into the  
21 weeds about what paint color they're going to use in a  
22 particular building or something.

23 So it's -- our goal is really to make sure that there  
24 is a body that's making sure the left hand and the right hand  
25 are working together. And I've used this example before. If we

1 know that a certain road is going to be repaved in year one, and  
2 then in year two they're going to come and rip it up to put a  
3 water or sewer in, that's counterintuitive to, you know, our  
4 fiscal responsibility. So those are the kind of things that  
5 you're looking at, not getting down -- and I know as residents,  
6 you have a lot of interest in these projects, but try to focus  
7 your questions on things that are related to, is this in support  
8 or conflict of the master plan? Is this in support or conflict  
9 with standard budgeting? Is there any right hand, left hand  
10 things that are working contrary to each other? That's really  
11 where your questions should be focused.

12 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Anything else for the good of  
13 the order, as you always say?

14 COMMISSIONER MARTIN: I won't ask about the bearcat  
15 again.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIS: Hearing none, meeting adjourned  
17 at 8:31 p.m.

18 (Recording concluded at 8:31 p.m.)  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I, SHEILA H. RAYMOND, do hereby certify that I was authorized to transcribe the foregoing recorded proceeding; and that the transcript is a true and accurate transcription, to the best of my ability, taken while listening to the provide recording.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said proceedings, nor in any way interested in the events of this cause, and that I am not related to any of the parties thereto.

Dated this 12th day of FEBRUARY 2024

*Sheila H Raymond*

\_\_\_\_\_  
SHEILA H. RAYMOND

*Andrea Storch Gruber* 3/6/2024  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Andrea Storch Gruber